

Press Office DAFM

From: Kelly, Aiden
Sent: Friday 31 January 2020 12:36
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE [REDACTED]

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed

Cleared

Aiden

Aiden Kelly
Private Secretary to the Secretary General
Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 31 January 2020 12:17
To: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: CLEARANCE [REDACTED]

SecGen,

Line for clearance please:

"We understand that the case referred to is not proceeding"

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

—
An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildara Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

—
T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 31 January 2020 12:15
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE [REDACTED]

Slight change

OK with this

MB

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: 31 January 2020 10:02
To: Blake, Martin
Cc: Joyce, Rita; Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg
Subject: CLEARANCE [REDACTED]

Martin,

Line for clearance please:

~~"Our understanding is~~ We understand that the case referred to is not proceeding"

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Wednesday 29 January 2020 14:47
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

NB: this prosecution is not going ahead.

I can give background details as required.

I will be guided by press office as to response to query- but please note that instructions re not proceeding with the case were only issued to our legal team this morning, so defence legal team/defendant himself may not even be aware yet- so suggest hold off on reply for now
When response does issue (eg Friday) perhaps "Our understanding is that the case referred to is not proceeding"

MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Wednesday 29 January 2020 14:23
To: Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>;
Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael
<Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM
<Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]

Sean/Rob/Deirdre,

Would you be able to assist with query below. I'm assuming this is an animal welfare case. The journalist is looking to arrange a photographer and is looking to find out the time of this case.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

—
An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sraid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

—
T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Wednesday 29 January 2020 13:16
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: Guidance request

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

To whom it concerns,

I need information on the following in order to arrange coverage of a trial which I understand is due to take place on Monday involving the Department.

Can you clarify what time the prosecution of a farmer called Brian Wright is due to take place at the District Court in Monaghan on Monday and how long the case is likely to last. I need this to arrange a photographer.

With thanks
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--
"Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail"

This e-mail and any attachments are confidential, may be legally privileged and are the property of [REDACTED] whose systems they were generated. [REDACTED] is the holding company for [REDACTED] is registered in [REDACTED] registered office [REDACTED] and is registered with [REDACTED]. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately and do not use, distribute, store or copy it in any way. Statements or opinions in this e-mail or any attachment are those of the author and are not necessarily agreed or authorized by [REDACTED] or any member of its group. [REDACTED] may monitor outgoing or incoming emails as permitted by law. It accepts no liability for viruses introduced by this e-mail or attachments.

[REDACTED]

Press Office DAFM

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Sunday 16 February 2020 19:07
To: Gleeson, Brendan
Cc: O'Connell, Eilis, Laffan, Meg, Press Office DAFM, SecGen
Subject: Fwd: [REDACTED]

Secretary,

FYI. The Press Office was informed on Friday that a Dept response was not available until early this week.

As per text from Eilis earlier today, the Press Office was not aware that the SIU was now under Eilis.

Regards,

Siobhán

From: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday, 14 February 2020 15:25
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde, Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
CC: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin" <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula" <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre" <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM" <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM" <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

John,

As a relevant person is on leave we won't be in a position to respond today, but can respond early next week

MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 14 February 2020 14:51
To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

Thank you Michael,

Kind regards,

John

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 14 February 2020 14:33
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula

<Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED]

John- as this was an ERAD case I am redirecting to Colm Forde

MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 14 February 2020 14:13
To: Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]

Hi Deirdre/Sean,

Please see below query from [REDACTED] for comment for [REDACTED]. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission? Thank you.

Kind regards,
John McDonald
CO. Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2082
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday 14 February 2020 13:20
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject:

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

To whom it concerns,

I need to seek comment on the following concerning representations received by the Department of Agriculture concerning a case involving a farm called Brian Wright of Newbliss, Clones, Co Monaghan.

Mr Wright was charged with various counts of animal cruelty by the Department by the case was dropped two weeks ago. I need the Department to comment on the following.

1. Did the Department receive any representations from Heather Humphries, the former minister, in relation to the case?
2. If so, what was the nature of the representation and did it result in the withdrawal of the charges against Mr Wright.
3. Was the representation taken into consideration before the decision was made to drop the charges?
4. Did this case involve the garda or the Director of Public Prosecutions?

With thanks

[Redacted signature and name]

"Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail"

This e-mail and any attachments are confidential, may be legally privileged and are the property of [Redacted] whose systems they were generated. [Redacted] the holding company for the [Redacted] p. [Redacted] has its registered office [Redacted] and is registered with [Redacted] if you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately and do not use, distribute, store or copy it in any way. Statements or opinions in this e-mail or any attachment are those of the author and are not necessarily agreed or authorised by [Redacted] or any member of its group [Redacted] monitor outgoing or incoming emails as permitted by law. It accepts no liability for viruses introduced by this e-mail or attachments.

[Redacted footer text]

MacAodhain, Frances

From: Sheahan, Michael
Sent: Sunday 16 February 2020 21:01
To: Forde, Colm
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

MS @ Lo

Fyi

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 16 February 2020 at 16:35:10 GMT
To: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>, Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

Meg- this email below more or less summarises the situation in relation to this case
From memory the case was due to be heard on Tuesday 4th February. Our legal team were instructed on 29th January not to proceed with the case.

To the best of my knowledge no representations were made to DAFM by Min Humphries. She did pass on to the SGs office a letter she received from the family of Mr Wright.
There were two principle reasons for the decision to drop the prosecution
(1) the underlying issues involved in this case were fully resolved, with the running of the herd taken over by as I understand it relatives of Mr Wright.
(2) legal services advised (as I understand it) that a prosecution was unlikely to succeed.

MS

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 30 January 2020 at 12:07:48 GMT
To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, O'Connor, Jarlath <Jarlath.O'Connor@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

From: Whelan, MargaretM
Sent: 30 January 2020 12:06
To: Devlin, Kieran
Cc: Forde, Colm; Killian, Helen, Cawley, Michelle
Subject: RE: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

(Out of Office)

Ms. ...

MS19

MacAodhain, Frances

From: Gleeson Brendan
Sent: Sunday 16 February 2020 17:05
To: Sheahan Michael
Subject: Re: MAFM -V- Brian Wright

Thanks Mike

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 16 February 2020 at 16:35:10 GMT
To: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>, Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

Meg- this email below more or less summarises the situation in relation to this case.
From memory the case was due to be heard on Tuesday 4th February. Our legal team were instructed on 29th January not to proceed with the case.

To the best of my knowledge no representations were made to DAFM by Min Humphries. She did pass on to the SGs office a letter she received from the family of Mr Wright.
There were two principle reasons for the decision to drop the prosecution
(1) the underlying issues involved in this case were fully resolved, with the running of the herd taken over by as I understand it relatives of Mr Wright.
(2) legal services advised (as I understand it) that a prosecution was unlikely to succeed

MS

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 30 January 2020 at 12:07:48 GMT
To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, O'Connor, Jarlath <Jarlath.O'Connor@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

From: Whelan, MargaretM
Sent: 30 January 2020 12:06
To: Devlin, Kieran
Cc: Forde, Colm; Killian, Helen; Cawley, Michelle
Subject: RE: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

Our Ref: 004/01

MS19

~~✗~~

MacAodhain, Frances

0138

From: Blake, Martin
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 07:36
To: SecGen
Subject: Fwd: MAFM v Wright
Attachments: Letter to Dept of Agriculture 161019.pdf; 3401340503032233-letter to Sol 31 Oct 19.pdf; RE: DAFM & Mr Brian Wright R1320819; RE: Dept of Agriculture & Brian Wright; Scanned from a Xerox Multifunction Printer.pdf

Aiden

SG may wish to have background to this case which made the papers yesterday.

MB


MacAodhain, Frances

MS. 18

From: Sheahan, Michael
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 12:50
To: Laffan, Meg
Cc: Blake, Martin; Gleeson, Brendan; Kinsella, John; Forde, Colm
Subject: RE: MAFM -V- Brian Wright

Meg, just for full clarity/accuracy, having spoken to both Colm and John
Point 1 below is correct- the issues that were to be the subject of prosecution were fully resolved, and the herd was
and is now under the care of a brother in law of Mr Wright (formally signed over to him on 10th Oct 2019)
Re point 2, it would be more correct to say that while legal services did discuss some potential legal difficulties in
relation to the case, they did not say that a prosecution was unlikely to succeed- they advised that it was ultimately
a policy decision whether to proceed or not (in light of the above points plus some points put forward re
compassionate grounds)

MS

 **From:** Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie> MS-17
Sent: Sunday 16 February 2020 16:35
To: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>, Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

Meg- this email below more or less summarises the situation in relation to this case.
From memory the case was due to be heard on Tuesday 4th February. Our legal team were instructed on 29th
January not to proceed with the case.

To the best of my knowledge no representations were made to DAFM by Min Humphries. She did pass on to the SGs
office a letter she received from the family of Mr Wright.

There were two principle reasons for the decision to drop the prosecution

(1) the underlying issues involved in this case were fully resolved, with the running of the herd taken over by as I
understand it relatives of Mr Wright.

(2) legal services advised (as I understand it) that a prosecution was unlikely to succeed

MS

From: Forde, Colm < > CF 34
Date: 30 January 2020 at 12:07:48 GMT
To: Sheahan, Michael < > >, OConnor, Jarlath
Subject: FW: MAFM -V- Brian Wright
Importance: High

From: Whelan, MargaretM
Sent: 30 January 2020 12:06
To: Devlin, Kieran
Cc: Forde, Colm; Killian, Helen; Cawley, Michelle

MacAodhain, Frances

From: Gleeson, Brendan
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 17:22
To: Sheahan, Michael
Subject: RE: Wright case docs

MS16

Michael,

Thanks for this. As discussed earlier I would like a note about the allegations at the end of the letter in relation to the manner in which the department handled the events around the seizure of the animals, compensation etc.

I accept as discussed today that neither these "allegations" nor the threat to publish them had any bearing on the determination in this case, but given that they have been made, it is important that we consider whether they have any merit.

Brendan

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:49
To: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: Wright case docs

MS15

SG,

1. Scanned copy of letter attached
2. Attached is a detailed email from Colm Forde setting out timelines etc and further background on the case
3. Below is text of email sent to VI in local office on 30/1/2020 setting out who made the decision etc

Michael Sheahan

From: Sheahan, Michael
Sent: 17 February 2020 14:38
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

I think John draft is excellent- suggest SG should clear MS

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:30
To: Sheahan, Michael
Cc: SecGen ; Blake, Martin ; BarryWalsh, Paula ; Bourke, Deirdre ; Murray, SeanM ; Whelan, MargaretM ; Joyce, Rita ; Press Office DAFM ; Laffan, Meg ; Kinsella, John
Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael,
Draft below for your clearance or amendment please.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 13:59
To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Thanks John and Michael - I think that draft accurately reflects the position

Regards
Colm

From: "Kinsella, John" <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday, 17 February 2020 13:27
To: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
CC: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin" <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula" <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre" <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM" <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM" <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Joyce, Rita" <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde, Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael, Meg,

I would recommend some changes:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision

to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

For your consideration.

Regards,

John

John Kinsella

Head of Legal Services

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

M +353 (0)87 386 2116 T +353 (0)1 607 2636

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael

Sent: 17 February 2020 12:40

To: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John

Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Delirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm

Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Meg -further to earlier tel conv here is first stab at a **DRAFT** Response in yellow for your obs-: I have spoken to John Kinsella and we agreed it would be good to run the draft by him as well so have copied him. Obviously others may have abs also.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to drop the case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February.

In compliance with data protection and GDPR rules a copy of the letter cannot be provided. DAFM cannot comment in detail on individual cases. Cases can be dropped for a variety of reasons, either policy or legal. Policy reasons for dropping a case can include but are not limited to compassionate grounds, changes in circumstances or personnel in relation to a business or the operator of a business, and the resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution.

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?

2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:32

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <Sec.Gen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see the press query below from [REDACTED] regarding the animal cruelty case covered in Sunday Times article. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission. Please note the journalist's deadline of 5pm today. Please advise the press office if this deadline cannot be met. Many thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:08

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED] Enquiry Re Animal Cruelty Case

Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Good morning

My query relates to news stories about Minister Heather Humphreys passing on a letter to the Department of Agriculture in relation to its prosecution of a Co Monaghan farmer Brian Wright on allegations of serious animal cruelty.

A Sunday Times report says that the case was dropped on the day the trial was due to start.

The letter delivered by minister Humphreys is reported to have contained unfounded allegations about officials involved in the prosecution.

I have the following questions:

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humprheys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

A response to this query would be appreciated by 5pm this evening, Monday February 17.
Regards,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: 17 February 2020 15:15
To: SecGen
Cc: Laffan, Meg; Press Office DAFM
Subject: CLEARANCE **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

SecGen,

For your clearance please, cleared by Martin Blake:

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine

A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases, however, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) from a third party was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publically available for Data Protection reasons.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Blake, Martin
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:12
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Joyce, Rita ; Laffan, Meg
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Anthony

I have suggested a slight re-ordering – to focus firstly on addressing the first question he poses.
Also to clarify that the letter addressed to Minister Humphrey's es from a third party
MB

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: 17 February 2020 14:43
To: Blake, Martin
Cc: Joyce, Rita; Laffan, Meg; Press Office DAFM
Subject: CLEARANCE **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Martin,

Draft for your clearance please.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:38
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

I think John draft is excellent- suggest SG should clear

MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:30
To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael,

Draft below for your clearance or amendment please.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 13:59
To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Thanks John and Michael - I think that draft accurately reflects the position

Regards
Colm

From: "Kinsella, John" <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday, 17 February 2020 13:27
To: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
CC: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin" <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula" <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre" <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM" <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM" <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Joyce, Rita" <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde, Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael, Meg,

I would recommend some changes:

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and

exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine

A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases, however, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) from a third party was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publically available for Data Protection reasons.

For your consideration.

Regards,

John

John Kinsella
Head of Legal Services

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

M +353 (0)87 386 2116 T +353 (0)1 607 2636
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael

Sent: 17 February 2020 12:40

To: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John

Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm

Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Meg -further to earlier tel conv here is first stab at a **DRAFT** Response in yellow for your obs-: I have spoken to John Kinsella and we agreed it would be good to run the draft by him as well so have copied him. Obviously others may have abs also.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to drop the case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February.

In compliance with data protection and GDPR rules a copy of the letter cannot be provided.

DAFM cannot comment in detail on individual cases. Cases can be dropped for a variety of reasons, either policy or legal. Policy reasons for dropping a case can include but are not limited to compassionate grounds, changes in circumstances or personnel in relation to a business or the operator of a business, and the resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution.

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:32

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see the press query below from [REDACTED] regarding the animal cruelty case covered in Sunday Times article. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission. Please note the journalist's deadline of 5pm today. Please advise the press office if this deadline cannot be met. Many thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

—
An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

—
T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:08
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED] Enquiry Re Animal Cruelty Case
Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Good morning

My query relates to news stories about Minister Heather Humphreys passing on a letter to the Department of Agriculture in relation to its prosecution of a Co Monaghan farmer Brian Wright on allegations of serious animal cruelty.

A Sunday Times report says that the case was dropped on the day the trial was due to start.

The letter delivered by minister Humphreys is reported to have contained unfounded allegations about officials involved in the prosecution.

I have the following questions:

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

A response to this query would be appreciated by 5pm this evening, Monday February 17.

Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kilroy, Aine
Sent: 17 February 2020 17:25
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg; Gleeson, Brendan; SecGen; Hoare, Jonathan
Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Anthony, slight amendment in red below.

Aine,

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:44
To: Kilroy, Aine
Cc: Press Office DAFM ; Laffan, Meg
Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aine,

For your clearance please. Journalist's deadline is 5pm today.

Regards,

Anthony

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:40

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Cleared by the SG.

Aiden

Aiden Kelly

Private Secretary to the Secretary General

Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:21

To: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 27th) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:17

To: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aiden Kelly

Private Secretary to the Secretary General

Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 13:59

To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael

<Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>;

BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre

<Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>;

Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita

<Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Thanks John and Michael - I think that draft accurately reflects the position

Regards

Colm

From: "Kinsella, John" <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday, 17 February 2020 13:27
To: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
CC: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin" <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula" <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre" <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM" <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM" <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Joyce, Rita" <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde, Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael, Meg,

I would recommend some changes:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publically available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

For your consideration.

Regards,

John

John Kinsella

Head of Legal Services

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

M +353 (0)87 386 2116 T +353 (0)1 607 2636

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael

Sent: 17 February 2020 12:40

To: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John

Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm

Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Meg -further to earlier tel conv here is first stab at a **DRAFT** Response in yellow for your obs-: I have spoken to John Kinsella and we agreed it would be good to run the draft by him as well so have copied him. Obviously others may have abs also.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to drop the case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February.

In compliance with data protection and GDPR rules a copy of the letter cannot be provided. DAFM cannot comment in detail on individual cases. Cases can be dropped for a variety of reasons, either policy or legal. Policy reasons for dropping a case can include but are not limited to compassionate grounds, changes in circumstances or personnel in relation to a business or the operator of a business, and the resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution.

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:32

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see the press query below from [REDACTED] regarding the animal cruelty case covered in Sunday Times article. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission. Please note the journalist's deadline of 5pm today. Please advise the press office if this deadline cannot be met. Many thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

1 • 353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:08

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED] Enquiry Re Animal Cruelty Case

Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Good morning

My query relates to news stories about Minister Heather Humphreys passing on a letter to the Department of Agriculture in relation to its prosecution of a Co Monaghan farmer Brian Wright on allegations of serious animal cruelty.

A Sunday Times report says that the case was dropped on the day the trial was due to start.

The letter delivered by minister Humphreys is reported to have contained unfounded allegations about officials involved in the prosecution.

I have the following questions:

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

A response to this query would be appreciated by 5pm this evening, Monday February 17.

Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

MacAodhain, Frances

From: Gleeson, Brendan
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 17:22
To: Sheahan, Michael
Subject: RE Wright case docs

MS16

Michael,

Thanks for this. As discussed earlier I would like a note about the allegations at the end of the letter in relation to the manner in which the department handled the events around the seizure of the animals, compensation etc. I accept as discussed today that neither these "allegations" nor the threat to publish them had any bearing on the determination in this case, but given that they have been made, it is important that we consider whether they have any merit.

Brendan

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:49
To: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: Wright case docs

MS15

SG,

1. Scanned copy of letter attached
2. Attached is a detailed email from Colm Forde setting out timelines etc and further background on the case
3. Below is text of email sent to VI in local office on 30/1/2020 setting out who made the decision etc.

Michael Sheahan

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: 17 February 2020 17:28
To: SecGen
Cc: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg
Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

SecGem,

Slight change below from Aine Kilroy highlighted, is this change ok?

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Kilroy, Aine
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 17:25
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg ; Gleeson, Brendan ; SecGen ; Hoare, Jonathan
Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

*Anthony, slight amendment in red below.
Aine.*

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts

of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:44
To: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aine,

For your clearance please. Journalist's deadline is 5pm today.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:40
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Cleared by the SG.

Aiden

Aiden Kelly
Private Secretary to the Secretary General
Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:21
To: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:17
To: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: FW: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aiden Kelly
Private Secretary to the Secretary General
Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 13:59
To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>;

BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today [REDACTED] - Comment on Case**

Thanks John and Michael - I think that draft accurately reflects the position

Regards
Colm

From: "Kinsella, John" <John.kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday, 17 February 2020 13:27
To: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
CC: SecGen <secgen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin" <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula" <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre" <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM" <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM" <MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Joyce, Rita" <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde, Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: **deadline today [REDACTED] - Comment on Case**

Michael, Meg,

I would recommend some changes:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publically available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

For your consideration.

Regards,

John

John Kinsella
Head of Legal Services

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

M +353 (0)87 386 2116 T +353 (0)1 607 2636
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael
Sent: 17 February 2020 12:40
To: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John
Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm
Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Meg -further to earlier tel conv here is first stab at a **DRAFT** Response in yellow for your obs-: I have spoken to John Kinsella and we agreed it would be good to run the draft by him as well so have copied him. Obviously others may have abs also.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to drop the case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February.

In compliance with data protection and GDPR rules a copy of the letter cannot be provided.

DAFM cannot comment in detail on individual cases. Cases can be dropped for a variety of reasons, either policy or legal. Policy reasons for dropping a case can include but are not limited to compassionate grounds, changes in circumstances or personnel in relation to a business or the operator of a business, and the resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution.

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?

5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:32
To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelehan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case
Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see the press query below from [REDACTED] regarding the animal cruelty case covered in Sunday Times article. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission. Please note the journalist's deadline of 5pm today. Please advise the press office if this deadline cannot be met. Many thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED] >
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:08
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED] Enquiry Re Animal Cruelty Case
Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Good morning

My query relates to news stories about Minister Heather Humphreys passing on a letter to the Department of Agriculture in relation to its prosecution of a Co Monaghan farmer Brian Wright on allegations of serious animal cruelty.

A Sunday Times report says that the case was dropped on the day the trial was due to start.

The letter delivered by minister Humphreys is reported to have contained unfounded allegations about officials involved in the prosecution.

I have the following questions:

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

A response to this query would be appreciated by 5pm this evening, Monday February 17.

Regards,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

From: Kelly, Aiden
Sent: 17 February 2020 17:35
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg
Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

That's fine

Aiden

Aiden Kelly

Private Secretary to the Secretary General

Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Press Office DAFM

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 17:28

To: SecGen

Cc: Press Office DAFM ; Laffan, Meg

Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

SecGen,

Slight change below from Aine Kilroy highlighted, is this change ok?

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 17:25

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Gleeson, Brendan

<Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Hoare, Jonathan

<Jonathan.Hoare@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Anthony, slight amendment in red below.

Aine.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:44

To: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aine,

For your clearance please. Journalist's deadline is 5pm today.

Regards,

Anthony

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:40

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Created by PRO56

Aiden

Aiden Kelly

Private Secretary to the Secretary General

Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 15:21

To: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts

of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 14:17

To: Gleeson, Brendan <Brendan.Gleeson@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Aiden Kelly

Private Secretary to the Secretary General

Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 13:59

To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael

<Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg

<Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>;

BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre

<Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>;

Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita

<Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Thanks John and Michael - I think that draft accurately reflects the position

Regards

Colm

From: "Kinsella, John" <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday, 17 February 2020 13:27

To: "Sheahan, Michael" <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM

<Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

CC: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Blake, Martin"

<Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>, "BarryWalsh, Paula"

<Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Bourke, Deirdre"

<Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Murray, SeanM"

<SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Whelan, MargaretM"

<MargaretM.Whehan@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Joyce, Rita" <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Forde,

Colm" <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: RE: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Michael, Meg,

I would recommend some changes:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

For your consideration.

Regards,

John

John Kinsella

Head of Legal Services

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

M +353 (0)87 386 2116 T +353 (0)1 607 2636

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael

Sent: 17 February 2020 12:40

To: Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Kinsella, John

Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm

Subject: RE: ****deadline today**** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Meg -further to earlier tel conv here is first stab at a **DRAFT** Response in yellow for your obs-: I have spoken to John Kinsella and we agreed it would be good to run the draft by him as well so have copied him. Obviously others may have abs also.

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to drop the case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February.

In compliance with data protection and GDPR rules a copy of the letter cannot be provided.

DAFM cannot comment in detail on individual cases. Cases can be dropped for a variety of reasons, either policy or legal. Policy reasons for dropping a case can include but are not limited to compassionate grounds, changes in circumstances or personnel in relation to a business or the

operator of a business, and the resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution.

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:32

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.WheLAN@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: **deadline today** [REDACTED] - Comment on Case

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see the press query below from [REDACTED] regarding the animal cruelty case covered in Sunday Times article. Can you please prepare a response and send it to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward transmission. Please note the journalist's deadline of 5pm today. Please advise the press office if this deadline cannot be met. Many thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 11:08

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED] Enquiry Re Animal Cruelty Case

Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Good morning

My query relates to news stories about Minister Heather Humphreys passing on a letter to the Department of Agriculture in relation to its prosecution of a Co Monaghan farmer Brian Wright on allegations of serious animal cruelty.

A Sunday Times report says that the case was dropped on the day the trial was due to start.

The letter delivered by minister Humphreys is reported to have contained unfounded allegations about officials involved in the prosecution.

I have the following questions:

1. Why was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
2. Will the Department provide a copy of the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys?
3. On what date was the letter delivered by Ms Humphreys received by the Department?
4. On what date was the case against Mr Wright dropped?
5. Did the letter provided to the department by Ms Humphreys play a role in the decision to drop the case?

A response to this query would be appreciated by 5pm this evening, Monday February 17.

Regards,

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Press Office DAFM

From: Kilroy, Aine
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:27
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: SecGen; Laffan, Meg
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] - Follow up Animal cruelty case

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed

Cleared, thanks

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 14:08
To: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

Aine,

For clearance please.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 13:54
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

Cleared

Aiden Kelly
Private Secretary to the Secretary General
Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 13:49
To: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

SecGen,

For clearance please:

"As indicated previously, the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case".

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 13:09
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: Re: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

Good with me

MB

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 18 February 2020 at 12:05:44 GMT
To: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: CLEARANCE [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

Martin,

For clearance please:

"As indicated previously, the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case".

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 11:54
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED] - Follow up Animal cruelty case

Having discussed with John (on leave) rather than offering no response (which might lead to incorrect inferences being drawn) he suggests we consider the following response:

"As indicated previously, the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case".

MS

From: Sheahan, Michael
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 11:19
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: RE: [REDACTED] - Follow up Animal cruelty case

Subject to any alternative views I would not be inclined to offer further comment at this point.

Michael Sheahan
Director, Veterinary Operations,
Floor 5 East,
Kildare St.,
Dublin 2

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 09:49
To: Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED] Follow up Animal cruelty case

John/Michael,

Please see follow up query from [REDACTED] in relation to the content of the letter. Please advise if you wish to response, send to press@agriculture.gov.ie for onward clearance.

Regards

Denise Doherty
Press Office
Communications Division

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2568
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday 17 February 2020 20:33
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: Re: [REDACTED] cruelty case

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Anthony

Can you tell me if the decision to withdraw the charges was linked to the content of the letter?

Regards
[REDACTED]

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Date: 17 February 2020 at 17:48:56 GMT
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED] - Animal cruelty case

Please see below with regard to your query:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn

for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bales
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sraid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Clath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Sunday 16 February 2020 14:03
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: re Sunday Times story

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Hi,

I was hoping to have a word with someone about the story that is in the Sunday Times today concerning farmer Brian Wright and the apparent decision of the Dept of Agriculture in Dublin not to pursue animal cruelty charges against the Co Monaghan farmer, following receipt of a letter delivered by enterprise minister Heather Humphreys making certain unfounded allegations against department officials.

I can be contacted at this email or a [REDACTED]

Regards
[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

This e-mail and any files and attachments transmitted with it are confidential and/or privileged. They are intended solely for the use of the intended recipient. Any views and opinions expressed are those of individual author/sender and are not necessarily shared or endorsed by [REDACTED] or any associated or related company. The content of this e-mail and any file or attachment transmitted with it may have been changed or altered without the consent of the author. If you are not the intended recipient, please note that any review, dissemination, disclosure, alteration, printing, circulation or transmission of this e-mail and/or any file or attachment transmitted with it, is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this e-mail or any file or attachment transmitted with it in error please notify the sender

[REDACTED]

Disclaimer:

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

The information contained in this email and in any attachments is confidential and is designated solely for the attention and use of the intended recipient(s). This information may be subject to legal and professional privilege. If you are not an intended recipient of this email, you must not use, disclose, copy, distribute or retain this message or any part of it. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete all copies of this email from your computer system(s).

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Tá an t-eolais san ríomhphost seo, agus in aon ceanglán leis, faoi phribhléid agus faoi rún agus le h-aghaidh an seofaí amháin. D'fhéadfadh ábhar an seoladh seo bheith faoi phribhléid profisiúnta nó dlíthiúil. Mura tusa an seolaí a bhí beartaithe leis an ríomhphost seo a fháil, tá cosc air, nó aon chuid de, a úsáid, a chóipeál, nó a scaoileadh. Má tháinig sé chugat de bharr dearmad, téigh i dteagmháil leis an seoltóir agus scríob an t-ábhar ó do ríomhaire le do thoil.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

This e-mail and any files and attachments transmitted with it are confidential and/or privileged. They are intended solely for the use of the intended recipient. Any views and opinions expressed are those of individual author/sender and are not necessarily shared or endorsed by [REDACTED] or any associated or related company. The content of this e-mail and any file or attachment transmitted with it may have been changed or altered without the consent of the author. If you are not the intended recipient, please note that any review, dissemination, disclosure, alteration, printing, circulation or transmission of this e-mail and/or any file or attachment transmitted with it, is prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this e-mail or any file or attachment transmitted with it in error please notify the sender

[REDACTED]

Press Office DAFM

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:27
To: Sheahan, Michael; Kinsella, John
Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm; Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg
Subject: *new [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case
Attachments: [REDACTED] - Comment on Case (MAFM vs Wright)

Tracking:	Recipient	Read
	Sheahan, Michael	Read 18/02/2020 15:32
	Kinsella, John	Read 18/02/2020 15:51
	SecGen	
	Blake, Martin	
	BarryWalsh, Paula	Read 18/02/2020 18:21
	Bourke, Deirdre	
	Murray, SeanM	Read 18/02/2020 15:27
	Whelan, MargaretM	Read 18/02/2020 16:21
	Joyce, Rita	
	Forde, Colm	Read 18/02/2020 16:01
	Press Office DAFM	
	Laffan, Meg	
	Kelly, Aiden	Read 18/02/2020 15:29
	Smith, Ann	Read 19/02/2020 09:21

Dear all,

Please see below updated query from [REDACTED] with some additional questions (additional questions highlighted). Please confirm if the attached cleared response (sent yesterday to [REDACTED] of the Irish Independent) will suffice in response for now or if you wish to add any additional text in light of additional questions. Thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mera
Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:13
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject:

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Dear John,

I need to follow up on the questions I submitted last week concerning representations received by the Department of Agriculture about a case involving a farm called Brian Wright of Newbliss, Clones, Co Monaghan.

Mr Wright was charged with various counts of animal cruelty by the Department by the case was dropped two weeks ago. I need the Department to comment on the following. I also need to seek comment on addition questions I am attaching.

1. Did the Department receive any representations from Heather Humphreys in relation to the case?
2. If so, what was the nature of the representation and did it result in the withdrawal of the charges against Mr Wright.
3. Was the representation taken into consideration before the decision was made to drop the charges?
4. Did the legal services division of the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges? Or did another person in the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges?
5. Was the letter received by the Department prompt the decision to withdraw the charges?

You might be aware that Heather Humphreys has acknowledged she delivered a letter about this case to the Department. I need to ask if this letter was delivered to Minister Creed or a member of his staff? What happened the letter when it was delivered to the Department?

I would be obliged if you could provide responses to the questions I submitted as soon as possible. If you have responses to the questions I submitted last week, could you send them onwards?

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kilroy, Aine
Sent: 20 February 2020 14:09
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg; Blake, Martin; SecGen
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE FW: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

If possible, that would be great Anthony, thanks.

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 13:52
To: "Kilroy, Aine"
CC: "Laffan, Meg" , "Blake, Martin" , SecGen , Press Office DAFM
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE FW: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

Aine,
I literally just sent the reply a moment ago as it had been cleared by yourself and SecGen earlier. I can send an additional email stating this extra line if you wish?
Kind regards,
Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine
An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Kilroy, Aine
Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 13:45
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg ; Blake, Martin ; SecGen
Subject: RE: CLEARANCE FW: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case
Anthony,
Just reading John Mooney's query again below – can we confirm that the letter was not delivered to Minister Creed or his office?
Thanks,
Áine.

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 10:12
To: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: CLEARANCE FW: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

Aine,
Please see the attached cleared (and issued) response sent to [REDACTED] recently, proposed to issue to [REDACTED]. For your clearance to issue please. FYI, the journalist followed up again this morning, he's hoping for a response today if possible. Thanks.

Regards,

Anthony

From: Kelly, Aiden <Aiden.Kelly@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 10:00

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: Re: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case
Cleared

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Thursday, 20 February 2020 09:55

To: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>

CC: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, "Laffan, Meg" <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: FW: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

SecGen,

Attached cleared (and issued) response proposed to issue to [REDACTED]. For your clearance to issue please.

Regards

Denise Doherty

Press Office

Communications Division

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2568

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:40

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>;

BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre

<Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>;

Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita

<Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg

<Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: RE: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

Anthony,

For me suggest go with the cleared response, unless any views to the contrary from Meg or others
MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:27

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John

<John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>;

BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre

<Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>;

Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita

<Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM

<Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: *new* [REDACTED] - Animal Welfare case

Dear all,

Please see below updated query from [REDACTED] with some additional questions (additional questions highlighted). Please confirm if the attached cleared response (sent yesterday to [REDACTED]) will suffice in response for now or if you wish to add any additional text in light of additional questions. Thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Mooney, John <john.mooney@sunday-times.ie>

Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:13

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject:

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Dear [REDACTED],

I need to follow up on the questions I submitted last week concerning representations received by the Department of Agriculture about a case involving a farm called Brian Wright of Newbliss, Clones, Co Monaghan.

Mr Wright was charged with various counts of animal cruelty by the Department by the case was dropped two weeks ago. I need the Department to comment on the following. I also need to seek comment on addition questions I am attaching.

1. Did the Department receive any representations from Heather Humphreys in relation to the case?
2. If so, what was the nature of the representation and did it result in the withdrawal of the charges against Mr Wright.
3. Was the representation taken into consideration before the decision was made to drop the charges?
4. Did the legal services division of the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges? Or did another person in the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges?
5. Was the letter received by the Department prompt the decision to withdraw the charges?

You might be aware that Heather Humphreys has acknowledged she delivered a letter about this case to the Department. I need to ask if this letter was delivered to Minister Creed or a member of his staff? What happened the letter when it was delivered to the Department?

I would be obliged if you could provide responses to the questions I submitted as soon as possible. If you have responses to the questions I submitted last week, could you send them onwards?

[REDACTED]

From: Press Office DAFM

Sent: 20 February 2020 14:35

To: Sheahan, Michael; Kinsella, John

Cc: SecGen; Blake, Martin; BarryWalsh, Paula; Bourke, Deirdre; Murray, SeanM; Whelan, MargaretM; Joyce, Rita; Forde, Colm; Press Office DAFM; Laffan, Meg; Doyle, Rob

Subject: **new** [REDACTED] - MAFM vs Wright - COB today

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see below new query from [REDACTED] (the first question has been answered in a subsequent email sent to journalist at same time this arrived). He's looking for a response ASAP.
Thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Officer

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 14:05

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: Re: [REDACTED] - MAFM vs Wright

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Dear Anthony,

I need clarification on the following. Was the letter sent to Michael Creed or officials in his office?

Can you also explain why the Department would consider a letter written by a third party about a case before the courts?

I understand the legal services division at the Department were not consulted about this case?

I need comment on the specific questions as we are publishing a substantial piece on this case in this weekends edition.

With thanks

On Thursday, 20 February 2020, Press Office DAFM <press@agriculture.gov.ie> wrote:

In response to your queries:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates

Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talamhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Department of Agriculture Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567

www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:13
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject:

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Dear John,

I need to follow up on the questions I submitted last week concerning representations received by the Department of Agriculture about a case involving a farm called Brian Wright of Newbliss, Clones, Co Monaghan.

Mr Wright was charged with various counts of animal cruelty by the Department by the case was dropped two weeks ago. I need the Department to comment on the following. I also need to seek comment on addition questions I am attaching.

1. Did the Department receive any representations from Heather Humphreys in relation to the case?
2. If so, what was the nature of the representation and did it result in the withdrawal of the charges against Mr Wright.
3. Was the representation taken into consideration before the decision was made to drop the charges?
4. Did the legal services division of the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges? Or did another person in the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges?
5. Was the letter received by the Department prompt the decision to withdraw the charges?

You might be aware that Heather Humphreys has acknowledged she delivered a letter about this case to the Department. I need to ask if this letter was delivered to Minister Creed or a member of his staff? What happened the letter when it was delivered to the Department?

I would be obliged if you could provide responses to the questions I submitted as soon as possible. If you have responses to the questions I submitted last week, could you send them onwards?

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Press Office DAFM

From: Kelly, Aiden
Sent: Friday 21 February 2020 11:59
To: Press Office DAFM
Cc: Laffan, Meg
Subject: [REDACTED]
today

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed

Cleared

Aiden Kelly
Private Secretary to the Secretary General
Ph (01) 6072184

Email: aiden.kelly@agriculture.gov.ie

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 21 February 2020 11:49
To: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]

SecGen,

Response below for your clearance please. Cleared by Martin Blake. Thanks.

Regards,
Anthony

From: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Friday 21 February 2020 11:36
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>; OConnell, Eilis <eilis.oconnell@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]

Good with me

Thanks

M

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Date: 21 February 2020 at 10:52:49 GMT

To: Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>, BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>, Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>, Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>, Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>, Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>, Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>, Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>, OConnell, Ellis <ellis.oconnell@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

Martin,

Pls see amended draft reply for clearance:

The letter was received by Departmental officials and was passed directly to the appropriate senior line manager. It was not referred to the Minister's Office.

As is normal procedure the relevant policy division, Legal Services division and the relevant local manager were involved and consulted at all appropriate stages in relation to this case.

Rgds,

Meg

From: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 17:17

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

Just to confirm John Kinsella is ok with the draft response.

Others may wish to add/subtract

MS

From: Sheahan, Michael

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 16:39

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

Anthony:

I note a number of people are on leave/out of office and I am on leave tomorrow I have put together a first draft of a response for others to consider- (John Kinsella is on leave but I had a brief tel conversation with Brendan Foley in relation to the third point.)

The letter was received in the SGs office and passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration.

As is normal procedure, legal services within DAFM, the relevant central policy division, and the relevant local manager were involved and consulted at all appropriate stages in relation to this case.

All representations and correspondence received by DAFM are opened, read and dealt with as appropriate.

MS

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 14:38

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob <Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

Dear all,

Another email attached from [REDACTED] with more questions as follows re: letter from Minister Humphreys:

- Who was it sent to? Was it sent to the officials involved in the case?
- Can you clarify what branch of the department received the correspondence?

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 14:35

To: Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Kinsella, John <John.Kinsella@agriculture.gov.ie>

Cc: SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Bourke, Deirdre <Deirdre.Bourke@agriculture.gov.ie>; Murray, SeanM <SeanM.Murray@agriculture.gov.ie>; Whelan, MargaretM <MargaretM.Whelan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>; Forde, Colm <Colm.Forde@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Doyle, Rob

<Rob.Doyle@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

Importance: High

Dear all,

Please see below new query from [REDACTED] (the first question has been answered in a subsequent email sent to Journalist at same time this arrived). He's looking for a response ASAP. Thanks.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dublin 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 607 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Thursday 20 February 2020 14:05

To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>

Subject: [REDACTED]

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Dear Anthony,

I need clarification on the following. Was the letter sent to Michael Creed or officials in his office?

Can you also explain why the Department would consider a letter written by a third party about a case before the courts?

I understand the legal services division at the Department were not consulted about this case?

I need comment on the specific questions as we are publishing a substantial piece on this case in this weekends edition.

With thanks

On Thursday, 20 February 2020, Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie> wrote:

[REDACTED]

In response to your queries:

A letter addressed to Minister Humphries (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphries publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a changes in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

Kind regards,

Anthony Bates
Press and Information Office

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

An Teach Talmhaíochta, Sráid Chill Dara, Baile Átha Cliath 2, D02 WK12
Agriculture House, Kildare Street, Dub 2, D02 WK12

T +353 (0)1 507 2567
www.agriculture.gov.ie

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday 18 February 2020 15:13
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject:

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie .

Dear John,

I need to follow up on the questions I submitted last week concerning representations received by the Department of Agriculture about a case involving a farm called Brian Wright of Newbliss, Clones, Co Monaghan.

Mr Wright was charged with various counts of animal cruelty by the Department by the case was dropped two weeks ago. I need the Department to comment on the following. I also need to seek comment on addition questions I am attaching.

1. Did the Department receive any representations from Heather Humphreys In relation to the case?
2. If so, what was the nature of the representation and did it result in the withdrawal of the charges against Mr Wright.
3. Was the representation taken into consideration before the decision was made to drop the charges?
4. Did the legal services division of the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges? Or did another person in the Department make the decision to withdraw the charges?
5. Was the letter received by the Department prompt the decision to withdraw the charges?

You might be aware that Heather Humphreys has acknowledged she delivered a letter about this case to the Department. I need to ask if this letter was delivered to Minister Creed or a member of his staff? What happened the letter when it was delivered to the Department?

I would be obliged if you could provide responses to the questions I submitted as soon as possible. If you have responses to the questions I submitted last week, could you send them onwards?

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

"Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail"

This e-mail and any attachments are confidential, may be legally privileged and are the property of [REDACTED] on whose systems they were generated. [REDACTED] holding company for the [REDACTED] is registered in [REDACTED] as its registered office at [REDACTED] and is registered with [REDACTED]. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately and do not use, distribute, store or copy it in any way. Statements or opinions in this e-mail or any attachment are those of the author and are not necessarily agreed or authorised by [REDACTED].

Press Office DAFM

From: Press Office DAFM
Sent: Monday 24 February 2020 17:24
To: Kilroy, Aine, SecGen
Cc: Laffan, Meg; Blake, Martin; Sheahan, Michael; BarryWalsh, Paula; Joyce, Rita; Press Office DAFM
Subject: [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 24 February 2020 15:59
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]

Cleared at this end, thanks.

From: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Sent: Monday 24 February 2020 15:51
To: Kilroy, Aine <Aine.Kilroy@agriculture.gov.ie>; SecGen <SecGen@agriculture.gov.ie>
Cc: Laffan, Meg <Meg.Laffan@agriculture.gov.ie>; Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>; Blake, Martin <Martin.Blake@agriculture.gov.ie>; Sheahan, Michael <Michael.Sheahan@agriculture.gov.ie>; BarryWalsh, Paula <Paula.BarryWalsh@agriculture.gov.ie>; Joyce, Rita <Rita.Joyce@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]
Importance: High

Aine/SecGen,

Please see request below from [REDACTED] regarding Minister Humphreys letter to DAFM. The following text is a composite of what was cleared and issued to [REDACTED]. Could you please confirm your clearance of this text to issue to [REDACTED] also? Please note [REDACTED] deadline of 5pm this evening. Thanks.

Regards,
Anthony

A letter addressed to Minister Humphreys (dated January 22nd) was received in DAFM on 24th January, and was passed to the appropriate senior line manager for consideration. A decision to withdraw the prosecution case against Mr Wright was relayed to his legal representatives on 29th January, in advance of the scheduled court case on Tuesday 4th February. The Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine (DAFM) cannot make the letter originally provided to Minister Humphreys publicly available for Data Protection reasons. However, DAFM can confirm that no political representations were made with regard to this case and the decision taken to withdraw the prosecution in this case was taken by relevant DAFM Officials having regard to the full and individual circumstances of this case. The letter was received by Departmental officials and was passed directly to the appropriate senior line manager. It was not referred to the Minister's Office. As is normal procedure the relevant policy division, Legal Services division and the relevant local manager were involved and consulted at all appropriate stages in relation to this case.

It is important to clarify that Prosecutors are not legally compelled to pursue all prosecution cases to a final conclusion in the courts. Occasionally, there may be instances where the facts of a case are such that proceeding with a prosecution may not be considered desirable, appropriate or justifiable. Prosecution cases can be withdrawn for a variety of reasons. For example, decisions can be made to withdraw prosecutions based on legal advice, or as a result of a change in circumstances or personnel of a business or the operator of a business, or because of a satisfactory resolution of the original issues that were the subject of the prosecution or, where appropriate, on humanitarian or compassionate grounds. It is entirely a matter for DAFM to decide when it is and when it is not appropriate to proceed with a prosecution against an individual. DAFM takes its prosecutorial functions very seriously and exercises prudent and careful judgement in deciding how best to manage prosecutions brought in the name of the Minister for Agriculture, Food and the Marine.

It is not possible to state matters further or to comment specifically on the case of Mr Wright as DAFM does not comment in detail on individual cases.

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday 24 February 2020 15:31
To: Press Office DAFM <Press@agriculture.gov.ie>
Subject: [REDACTED]
Importance: High

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to Notifv.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie.

Hello,

Hope all is well

[REDACTED]

I'm getting in touch in relation to Enterprise Minister Heather Humphries reported intervention in an alleged case of animal cruelty involving Brian Wright and a report I'm compiling on same for this evening.

I'm seeking the statement the Department has prepared on this case and furnished to other media organisations, if possible?

I'm working towards a deadline of 5pm. Please feel free to contact me on this e-mail or on [REDACTED] or [REDACTED]

All the best

[REDACTED]