



13 Lower Dorset St.  
Dublin 1

17<sup>th</sup> June 2020

**RE: MRCI submission to Special Committee on Covid-19 Response.**

Dear Committee Members,

Please find attached MRCI submission to Special Committee on Covid-19 Response. This covers an overview of the Meat Processing Sector, presents new data on workers in the sector, outlines working and living conditions, and examines statutory and employers responses to COVID-19, address inspections and makes recommendations.

MRCI is currently collecting additional data relevant to the work of the Committee, which will be accessible in the coming weeks which we would like to submit when it is available.

MRCI is available to meet with the committee at its convenience.

Yours Sincerely,



Edel McGinley  
Director  
MRCI  
[edel@mrqi.ie](mailto:edel@mrqi.ie)  
087 7485695



**SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON COVID-19 RESPONSE SUBMISSION ON BEHALF OF THE MIGRANT RIGHTS  
CENTRE IRELAND  
17<sup>TH</sup> JUNE 2020**

**Table of Contents**

1. Introduction
  2. Overview of the Meat Processing Sector
    - a. Worker Data
      - i. Census Data 2016
      - ii. Employment Permits 2017-2020
      - iii. Nationality
      - iv. Number of Migrant Workers
    - b. Differing Contexts for EU and non-EU Workers
    - c. Working Conditions (incl. Health and Safety)
    - d. Housing & Living Conditions
    - e. The Meat Industry
  3. Responding to COVID-19
    - a. Putting Workers First
    - b. Quotes from Workers
    - c. Employer Response
    - d. Statutory Oversight
    - e. HSE and HPSC
    - f. Contact Tracing
      - i. Data Breach
      - ii. Institutional Racism & Public Sector Duty
  4. Inspections & Enforcement
    - a. Health and Safety Authority
    - b. Workplace Relations Body (Labour Inspectors)
  5. Recommendations
    - a. Closure of Affected Workplaces
    - b. HSE Investigation
    - c. Clarification of Responsibility
    - d. Mobility for Workers
    - e. Increased Inspections
    - f. Improved Data Collection
- Appendix I – Workers’ Data Breakdown
- Appendix II – WRC Inspections

## 1. Introduction

The Migrant Rights Centre Ireland (MRCI) welcomes the opportunity to make a Submission to the Special Committee on Covid-19 Response.

MRCI is a national organisation working to promote the rights of migrant workers and their families living in situations of vulnerability throughout Ireland. In 2019, MRCI provided information and support on 2,283 cases to people from 116 different countries.

Since 2003, MRCI has been working specifically with workers from the agriculture and food-processing sectors to expose exploitation, discrimination, and non-compliance.

Below is an outline of the key issues that workers in the meat processing sector have raised with us during the COVID-19 pandemic. The scope of the submission goes beyond, but includes, the 'tracing of close contacts of workers' as outlined in the committee's submission request.

## 2. Overview of the Meat Processing Sector

### **Workers Data**

The value of having up-to-date data cannot be overstated. There are serious limitations in publically available data collected on the participation of migrants in the labour market, including the meat sector<sup>1</sup>. CSO data is very limited in this area; the Labour Force Survey does not collect sufficient detail in Manufacturing of Food Products to give any insight into the meat sector; and the CSO business register does not have adequate data either.

### Census Data 2016

MRCI requested a special tabulation of Census Data 2016 to aid us in providing an accurate profile of workers in the meat sector. It is important to note that since 2016, a number of employment permits have been issued, which our data analysis includes below. According to Census 2016, there are 12,413 employees in meat production, processing and preserving of meat. 52% are Irish Nationals and 42% are migrant workers. 77% are male and 23% female 57% of the total workforce are aged between 25-44 years<sup>2</sup>.

### Employment Permits 2017-2020

In 2017, 183 employment permits were issued to meat processing companies<sup>3</sup>. In 2018, 978 were issued<sup>4</sup>; in 2019, 950 were issued<sup>5</sup>; and from January to May 2020, 931 employment permits were issued<sup>6</sup>. This make a total of 3,042. Excluding renewals (2017 – 2019; n.117), and taking into account the above census figures, the data reveals a total number of workers in this sector as being **15,338**.

### Nationality

The breakdown by nationality other than Irish in this sector (CSO 2016) - Polish – 39%, Lithuanian – 13%, Romanian 7%, Latvian – 6%, the rest of Europe and other EU – 25%. Workers outside of the EU include

---

<sup>1</sup> The 'Meat Sector' here includes beef, lamb, pigmeat, and poultry.

<sup>2</sup> CSO Census 2016, *Nationality - NACE 1010 Production, processing and preserving of meat, meat products and poultry*. Special tabulation accessed 10<sup>th</sup> June 2020

<sup>3</sup> Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Employment Permit Statistics 2017* [online], last updated 2<sup>nd</sup> January 2018, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/Publications/Employment-Permit-Statistics-2017.html>

<sup>4</sup> Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Employment Permit Statistics 2018* [online], last updated 16<sup>th</sup> January 2019, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/Publications/Employment-Permit-Statistics-2018.html>

<sup>5</sup> Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Employment Permit Statistics 2019* [online], last updated 3<sup>rd</sup> January 2020, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/Publications/Employment-Permit-Statistics-2019.html>

<sup>6</sup> Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Employment Permit Statistics 2020* [online], last updated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2020, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/Publications/Employment-Permit-Statistics-2020.html>

Brazilian – 6%, those from Africa, India, Asia and Americas – for example South Africa, Botswana, the Philippine account for 3% of the workforce. See Appendix 1, Table 1.

### Number of Migrant Workers

Of the 42% migrant workers in CSO 2016 data, EU workers account for 88% and Non-EU workers for 12%. However, when data from employment permits (2017, 2018, 2019 and 2020; excluding renewals) are included, the percentage of workers changes. With this added data, the **migrant workforce in this sector accounts for 58%**. Of this 59% are EU workers and 41% are non-EU workers. According to these available figure 19% of the workforce are on employment permits. See Appendix 1, Tables 2 to 4.

It is also important to note that this figures above will most likely not include undocumented migrants who also work in this sector, and are particularly vulnerable to exploitation and discrimination.

Workers report to MRCI that EU and No-EU workers are overrepresented on the factory floors. The available data for the range of occupations is very limited and therefore obscures the reality of the cross-section of role distribution and nationality. To fully understand this more detailed and disaggregated data is necessary.

### ***Differing Contexts for EU and Non-EU Workers***

EU workers have freedom movement under EU law, while workers from outside of the EU require employment permits to work. It can take up to five years or more to obtain citizenship or full access to the labour market in the State<sup>7</sup>. Therefore, it is important to note that immigration status creates specific sets of vulnerabilities and challenges.

For non-EU workers on employment permits (data 2017-2020), the added layer of vulnerability is that they are essentially tied to their employer<sup>8</sup>. This means that they can only work for the company listed on their employment permit in the position they were recruited into<sup>9</sup>. The below quote from Minister Heather Humphries during the recent Dáil debate created a misleading impression, regarding work-permit holders' rights and entitlements:

*"Migrant workers who come to this country have full employment rights and the full rates of pay to which everybody else is entitled. They are not tied to any one employer. If they wish to work for somebody else, they may do so...They too have full employment rights...They may change employer if they so wish. It is important to state that all of these workers have rights in that regard"*<sup>10</sup>

It is the experience of MRCI that employees on employment permits find it significantly more difficult to assert their rights. Workers report to us that they cannot choose not to come to work if ill, or seek

---

<sup>7</sup> Department for Justice and Equality, *Long Term Residency*, viewed 17<sup>th</sup> June 2020  
[http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/Long\\_Term\\_Residency#](http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/Long_Term_Residency#)

<sup>8</sup> Changing employer is a technical and complex process that often requires assistance. MRCI has been supporting workers for the past 19 years to navigate the complexity of the both the employment permit and immigration system. Changing employment is technically difficult. The worker must find an employer willing to apply for an employment permit, the employer must advertise the job for specified time to fulfil a labour market test, apply the 50:50 rule, pay a fee and process the permit before a workers can take up employment. Fear of losing immigration status and a lack of information about how the system works, therefore makes it extremely difficult for workers to change employers.

<sup>9</sup> Department for Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Changing Employers* [online], last updated 1<sup>st</sup> October 2014, viewed 17<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/What-We-Do/Workplace-and-Skills/Employment-Permits/Changing-Employer/>

<sup>10</sup> Humphries, H., *Dáil Debate: Outbreaks of Covid-19 in Meat Processing Plants* [online transcript], 21<sup>st</sup> May 2020, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, [https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/2020-05-21/7/#spk\\_318](https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/2020-05-21/7/#spk_318)

improved conditions for fear of losing their employment permit and immigration status<sup>11</sup>. This is also the case if they try to change employer. MRCI has long been calling for a move to sectoral permits to allow workers to effectively change jobs easily should they wish to do so.

Another worrying emerging issue are EU-workers employed through agencies rather than directly by a meat processing company. According to the Independent Workers Union, there are a number of EU workers who were forced to falsely declare as independent contractors in Poland (not their country of origin), while working in meat factories in Ireland for years. This meant that any social welfare contributions were being paid in Poland, and without PPSNs nor contributions in Ireland, they faced significant barriers in accessing social welfare support during the COVID-19 pandemic, including illness benefit. This practice warrants serious attention and investigation.

There are also unique set of circumstances for non-EU (and EU) workers in the border region (in the context of Brexit) whose access to goods and services may be in Northern Ireland. With a different set of immigration laws, this can negatively impact workers – with people being at greater risk of detention and deportation by UK authorities.

### ***Working Conditions (incl. Health and Safety)***

The meat processing sector is difficult and dangerous, with historically poor conditions for workers. Repetitive strain and workplace accidents are commonplace. MRCI has received reports (dating back 15 years) of **loss of limbs or digits; day-to-day lacerations; repeated injuries from faulty machines; falls; a lack of appropriate health and safety or role training; confusion on reporting or policy for health and safety incidents; incident reports not being responded to or even being made light of in official reporting.** Despite high incidents of health and safety breaches, the HSA reports only one prosecution in Cavan, where a worker was awarded just €2,000 for the loss of an eye<sup>12</sup>.

Meat factories often do not offer sick pay beyond the statutory rate, which impacts on workers income and choices about when to return to work after an injury or illness, or even during the current COVID-19 crisis.

Hours of work are often long and wages remain low, with some workers working up to 15 years with the same employer receiving just €11.50 per hour. On top of very limited or little to no progression for long-term workers, we also consistently hear reports from factories across Ireland of discrimination and workplace bullying.

These working conditions reflect the low level of value given to workers by this industry.

### ***Housing & Living Conditions***

MRCI has limited data on the housing conditions of workers. According to reports we have received, this can range from owner-occupied, family rental accommodation, and over-crowded rental accommodation with reports of more than ten co-workers living together. We also have heard of agency workers living in agency-owned accommodation and being threatened with eviction during COVID-19 if they complain about working conditions or the lack of health and safety measures to prevent virus spread. Agency workers are more vulnerable to accommodation issues as their housing is more likely to be supplied through the agency than a directly employee. It is also not clear what deductions are being made for accommodation.

Low wages often means that it commonplace to share with co-workers. More common arrangements for newly arrived migrant is that an employer puts the worker directly in touch with a specific landlord or estate agent. However, even if accommodation isn't directly owned by an employer and while there is

---

<sup>11</sup> Migrant Rights Centre Ireland, *Workers on the Move: Past Lessons and Future Perspectives on Ireland's Labour Migration*, December 2015

<sup>12</sup> Health and Safety Authority, *Prosecutions 2016* [online], viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020  
[https://www.hsa.ie/eng/topics/inspections/prosecutions/prosecutions\\_2016/#liffey](https://www.hsa.ie/eng/topics/inspections/prosecutions/prosecutions_2016/#liffey)

limited control, there is often a perception that raising concerns in the workplace could result in loss of accommodation.

Given the number of workers affected it would stand to reason that some people will have been referred to City West for isolation. We have no figures on this.

### ***The Meat Industry***

According to the Department of Agriculture the beef sector is worth €2.25 billion of exports.<sup>13</sup> Meat Industry Ireland, value the meat sector<sup>14</sup> as having an estimated export value of €3.81 billion<sup>15</sup>. This is clearly a high value sector to the Irish economy, and arguably why it was deemed essential during COVID-19, and equally possibly why there was a lack of political motivation to close factories when clusters emerged.

Also relevant to note is that this is a sector with a high levels of concentration among a few key employers. Structural features, for example, a focus on value-added generation – which relies on low wages to make a profit – arguably make it a sector that is less inclined to invest in the health and safety of their workforce. In Addition, this sector has a poor track record of engaging with or recognising Trade Unions in their workplaces.

The poor response in this sector as outlined below, arises out of these conditions to create a perfect storm for the emergence of COVID-19 clusters.

## **3. Responding to COVID-19**

### ***Putting Workers First***

People who are working to get vital food into our homes during this crisis deserve to have employers and a government that prioritise their safety and mitigate their exposure to COVID-19. It is unacceptable that these workers safety in Ireland has not been paramount during this crisis.

### ***Quotes from workers***

- *“There were no temperature checks and people were still coming into work when they were sick”*
- *“Staff were given one mask for the week that they had to bring home and wash at the end of each day”*
- *“People have been on top of each other, working shoulder to shoulder”*
- *“If the disease was in the animals, they’d have to close the place. But for the workers, the factories can do what they want”*
- *“There was no social distancing. You had to go through areas where everyone was on top of themselves, sneezing and coughing.”*
- *“They didn’t give us masks or gloves. We had to buy our own. People are scared...it’s not safe”*
- *“I’m so angry – how can a government allow this? They forgot about us, they did not care. It’s shocking.”*

---

<sup>13</sup> Bord Bia, *Beef Market Update: Growing the success of Irish food & horticulture* [online], May 2020, viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, [www.agriculture.gov.ie/media/migration/farmingsectors/beef/beeftaskforce/BordBiaMarketReport130520.pdf](http://www.agriculture.gov.ie/media/migration/farmingsectors/beef/beeftaskforce/BordBiaMarketReport130520.pdf)

<sup>14</sup> The ‘Meat Sector’ here includes beef, lamb, pigmeat, and poultry.

<sup>15</sup> IBEC, Meat Industry Ireland, *Meat Industry: Key Statistics 2018* [online], viewed 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020, [https://meatindustryireland.ie/Sectors/MII/MII.nsf/vPages/Meat\\_sector~key-statistics!OpenDocument](https://meatindustryireland.ie/Sectors/MII/MII.nsf/vPages/Meat_sector~key-statistics!OpenDocument)

### **Employer Response**

MRCI began to receive complaints from workers in the meat processing sector on 26<sup>th</sup> March 2020. They were worried, frightened, and angry about the conditions they were being forced to work in, and could foresee that without appropriate health and safety measures, their health and their families would be at risk.

MRCI supported these workers to raise their concerns with their employers. However, as we continued to receive ongoing complaints into May, it became clear that many meat processing employers were extremely slow to put in place adequate safety measures<sup>16</sup>. **This safety measures include: staggered breaks; two-metre floor markings; shields in between work stations; temperature testing; cleaning of workwear between use by different staff; adequate signage (in languages people could understand); and access to hygiene facilities.** The ongoing delays in implementing these measures resulted in unnecessary exposure among staff during the early weeks of the crisis. This has contributed to the growing number of clusters in meat processing plants across the country.

Employer response and response rate to cases of COVID-19 or clusters in their factories have been inconsistent and unclear. To date only one factory has closed to deal with the outbreak.

More recently, MRCI has heard reports, from both workers and local organisations supporting meat factory workers, that factories who have signed up to the Wage Subsidy Scheme are also asking their staff to claim Illness Benefit. Workers have also reported working longer hours, as a result of reduced staffing, which are not being recorded. They are also expecting a row back to poor health and safety standards after inspections.

### **Statutory Oversight**

Regulating the meat sector is complex and falls under a number of government departments. The Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, has responsibility for the Health and Safe Authority, Employment Permits, and the Workplace Relations Bodies including labour inspectors; the Department of Agriculture, has responsibility for Bord Bia and Teagasc; and the Department of Health has responsibility for the Food Safety Authority of Ireland.

These departments have overlapping responsibility across regulation and enforcement in this sector. While the meat sector is a highly-regulated industry in some regards, these departments and agencies have not previously prioritised the working conditions for employees in this sector prior to the COVID-19 pandemic.

### **Health Service Executive and Health Protection Surveillance Centre**

Due to COVID-19, the Department of Health was clearly responsible for health guidelines, contact tracing and both the Health Service Executive (HSE) and the Health Protection Surveillance Centre (HPSC) became central to the response. There are questions to be asked of a number of departments as why they deemed meat production to be essential, given their clear insight into the way this work is carried out and delivered – high intensity work, requiring contact on production lines - and why sectoral guidelines were not produced until 15<sup>th</sup> May.

Infectious diseases are reportable by a medical practitioners who then report the Medical Officer of Health for their investigation and control. COVID-19 is also reported, in anonymised format, to the HPSC for national surveillance, yet despite this gaps emerged, particularly in contact tracing.

---

<sup>16</sup> McSweeney, E., *COVID-19 outbreaks at Irish meat plants raise fears over worker safety* [online], last updated 1<sup>st</sup> May 2020, viewed 1<sup>st</sup> May 2020, <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2020/may/01/covid-19-outbreaks-at-irish-meat-plants-raise-fears-over-worker-safety>

## Contact Tracing

Minister Creed, Minister for Agriculture, Food, and the Marine, admitted on 30<sup>th</sup> April<sup>17</sup>, that he was aware of six clusters at meat processing plants. Yet guidelines for the sector were only issued on 15<sup>th</sup> May<sup>18</sup>. On 20<sup>th</sup> May, there were 16 clusters accounting for 828 confirmed cases – an increase of 328 over the week.

Latest figures from 3<sup>rd</sup> June, show 1,054 cases of Covid-19 confirmed across twenty meat plants, with fifteen factories are under "active investigation". 58% of patients are aged 25-44; 77.6% of them male; and seven have been treated in intensive care units with no fatalities<sup>19</sup>.

## Data Breach

On May 19<sup>th</sup> it was revealed that workers' test results were being shared in the first instance with employers before workers themselves. It is unacceptable that an employer would be given the results of a test before the person who is infected and is a gross and serious breach of confidentiality. While assurances have been given by the HSE and Data Protection Commissioner address this, it is unclear if new guidelines or training have been issued for staff who are carrying out contact tracing.

## Institutional Racism & Public Sector Duty

Deeply worrying are the revelations made by Director of Public Health in the mid-west, Dr Mai Mannix while speaking at a HSE briefing on 5th June. Her comments reveal a level of institutional racism and discrimination that led to this very serious data breach. She said,

*"...suppose again 20 to 40 of those [people] are non-English speaking. Each of those 20 phone calls could take at least half an hour or an hour, because you have to use a translation service...So you're potentially looking at five people in my department to take four hours to go through to contact each of **these types of people**."*<sup>20</sup>

All public bodies in Ireland have a Public Sector Equality and Human Rights Duty to promote equality and prevent discrimination and protect the human rights of everyone affected by their policies and plans as outlined in Section 42 of the *Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014*<sup>21</sup>.

The HSE's approach is clearly in breach of their public sector duty as it discriminates against people from a migrant background, at a time when workers needed the support of state services to remain safe. This undermines trust in the HSE, leaving workers and their families exposed, and without accessible information to isolate if necessary. While we appreciate the unprecedented nature of COVID-19, the HSE failed in its duty to effectively carry out contract tracing for a group of vulnerable workers. Moreover, these essential workers were forced to work on the frontline during a global pandemic, surely their needs should have been considered and addressed. This failure also led to the blaming and scapegoating of these workers in some local communities, while also providing an opportunity for racist discourse.

## 4. Inspections and Enforcement

### Health and Safety Authority

---

<sup>17</sup> RTE, *Dept aware of Covid-19 clusters at meat processing plants* [online], last updated 30<sup>th</sup> April 2020, viewed 30<sup>th</sup> April 2020, <https://www.rte.ie/news/politics/2020/0430/1135916-agriculture/>

<sup>18</sup> <https://www.hpsc.ie/a-z/respiratory/coronavirus/novelcoronavirus/guidance/outbreakmanagementguidance/outbreakcontrolinmeatfactories/Interim%20Guidance%20COVID-19%20Meat%20Factories.pdf>

<sup>19</sup> McNulty, F. RTE News, *HSE says contact tracing at meat plants as high as 90%* [online], last updated 5<sup>th</sup> June 2020, viewed 17<sup>th</sup> June 2020, <https://www.rte.ie/news/coronavirus/2020/0605/1145572-covid-meat-factories/>

<sup>20</sup> <https://www.farmersjournal.ie/15-meat-factories-under-active-investigation-550323>

<sup>21</sup> *Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission Act 2014, Section 42*

The remit of the HSA is to enforce Safety, Health and Welfare at Work. Testimony from Dr Sharon Mc Guinness of the HSA to the Oireachtas Committee on Covid-19, confirmed, that despite receiving reports by the HSA during April, as of 19<sup>th</sup> May, not a single inspection had been carried out in a meat factory<sup>22</sup>. It is deeply disturbing that the agency tasked with dealing with health and safety in the work place, did nothing to investigate reports made prior to this date.

Despite the Return to Work Safely Protocol introduced on 9th May 2020, no action was taken by the HSA. In response to a joint letter sent by MRCI and SIPTU (26<sup>th</sup> May 2020), the HSA confirmed that it began checking compliance with the Protocol from 18<sup>th</sup> May. They further outlined that they had received seven complaints about four different operators in the meat sector. The HSA has a suite of powers at its disposal and can shut down workplaces on the spot if this is deemed necessary, however these powers were not utilised in response to the COVID-19 clusters. There remains a lack of clarity and transparency in relation to the actions taken by the HSA across the meat sector and their plan in **moving forward to ensure compliance**.

#### Work Place Relations Bodies (Labour Inspectors)

Labour Inspectors visit places of employment and carry out investigations on behalf of the Workplace Relation Commission (WRC) in order to ensure compliance with equality and employment-related legislation and enforcement of employment permits.

Data on inspections in the meat sector is limited and not disaggregated so it is difficult to get a clear picture of breaches in this sector. The WRC only made a distinction in 2019 for the meat sector, prior to this it is not clear if inspections took place and under what category the data would be collected. Appendix 2 gives a breakdown of inspections across three different sectors where these *could* have taken place.

It is also important to note that when an agreement was reached for new quotas of employment permits in this meat sector, access to training (including language training) and suitable accommodation for workers was stipulated for workers (except de-boners) along with a corresponding regime of inspections and an information campaign by DBEI on rights and entitlements for workers<sup>23</sup>.

According to the WRC, since January 2019, 17 employers associated with meat processing have been inspected. In 6 of these cases contraventions of legislation have been detected and 3 have been approved for prosecution, with enquiries ongoing in the other three cases. No breaches of the language or accommodation conditions have been detected<sup>24</sup>. MRCI has supported workers to access English languages classes, therefore employers have clearly insufficiently met this condition. It is also unclear if a campaign of information has delivered better outcomes for workers, how many workers it reached, or how success was measured.

---

<sup>22</sup> Quinn-Mulligan, H., Farmers Journal, *No inspections carried out in meat plants – HSA* [online, last updated 19<sup>th</sup> May 2020, viewed 19<sup>th</sup> May 2020, <https://www.farmersjournal.ie/no-inspections-carried-out-in-meat-plants-hsa-546965>

<sup>23</sup> Department for Business, Enterprise and Innovation, *Horticultural Worker, Meat Processing Operative, Meat Deboner & Dairy Farm Assistant: Employment Permit Checklist* [online], viewed 17<sup>th</sup> June 2020 <https://dbei.gov.ie/en/Publications/Publication-files/Checklist-for-Horticultural-Meat-Dairy-General-Employment.pdf>

<sup>24</sup> Information obtained from the WRC Inspectorate; 16<sup>th</sup> June 2020

## **5. Recommendations**

Recommendations for future action outlined below for the consideration of the Special Committee on COVID-19 and inclusion in their final report.

### Closure of Work Places

1. We continue to call for workplaces where clusters are detected to be closed for two week period to carry out a deep clean and for workers to be paid in full during this time. After this period, for a staggered re-opening with oversight from the HSE and HAS where the health and safety of workers are paramount.

### Investigation

2. The HSE to carry out an investigation into follow-up contract tracing as it relates to workers and their families in this sector, including addressing institutional racism and discrimination in accessing their services.

### Responsibility

3. Clarify overall Ministerial and Departmental responsibility for the meat sector

### Mobility for Workers

4. Introduce sectoral work permits (including for workers already in the state) to enable workers to change employers easily

### Inspections

5. For the WRC to carry out a campaign of unannounced inspections in meat factories
6. For the HSA to carry out a regime of unannounced inspections in meat factories
7. Make available greater resources to Health and Safety inspectors and Labour Inspectors to carry out their functions
8. For the HSA to provide greater transparency on its plan to address concerns in the meat sector and beyond this industry

### Data Collection

9. Develop a system of data collection for this sector, including: number of workers, pay, occupation, nationality, age and gender, which allows for categorisation mirroring NACE 1010 (Production, processing and preserving of meat, meat products and poultry) to allow for better data collection and consistency of data presentation across relevant departments

## Appendix 1- Worker Data Breakdown

<b>Table 1 CSO 2016</b>	
<b>Nationality</b> (data excludes 1% not stated)	<b>% of workers in –production, processing and preserving of meat, meat products and poultry</b>
Poland	39%
Lithuania	13%
Romania	7%
Latvia	6%
Rest of Europe – including France, Germany, Spain and Italy + UK	5%
Brazil	6%
Other EU	20%
Africa India and other Asia	2%
America - Other America	0% (8 people)
Other nationalities	1%

<b>Table 2</b>	
<b>CSO Census data 2016</b>	
EU workers	Non-EU Workers
88%	12%

<b>Table 3</b>	
<b>CSO Census data 2016 + Employment permit Data</b>	
Irish Workers	EU + Non-EU Workers
42%	58%

<b>Table 4</b>	
<b>CSO Census data 2016 + Employment permit Data of 58%</b>	
EU workers	Non-EU Workers
59%	41%

## Appendix II – WRC Inspections

WRC Inspections relevant sector for Meat collated 11<sup>th</sup> June 2020

Year	Sector	Cases Completed	Number in Breach	Breach %	Employees	Unpaid Wages
2019	Meat Processing + Preserving	7	1	14%	1,610	0
	Agriculture, Fishing + Forestry	63	28	44%	3,582	86,689
	Manufacturing	53	24	45%	6,832	18,770
2018	Manufacturing	48	19	40%	3,678	51,584
	Food and Drink	656	439	67%	14,113	472,824
2017	Agriculture	48	36	75%	804	56,229
	Food and Drink	645	371	58%	8,077	444,643
	Manufacturing	38	18	47%	6,927	33,576
2016	Agriculture	47	22	47%	1,009	30,137
	Food and Drink	717	343	48%	10,634	332,903
	Manufacturing	45	16	36%	3,974	25,385
Year	Sector	Number of inspection		Compliance rate		Unpaid wages recovered
2015	Agriculture	38		73%		13,869
	Food + Drink	273		45%		121,159
	Manufacturing	17		65%		21,291
2014	Agriculture	45		42%		17,965
	Food + Drink	996		40%		289,747
	Manufacturing	69		65%		3,885