



**Tithe an  
Oireachtais**  
**Houses of the  
Oireachtas**

**TITHE AN OIREACHTAIS**

**An Comhchoiste um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht**

**TUARASCÁIL BHLIANTÚIL 2018**

---

**HOUSES OF THE OIREACHTAS**

**Joint Committee on Business, Enterprise and Innovation**

**ANNUAL REPORT 2018**

**032BEI017**



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Content and Format of Report .....	2
2. Establishment and Functions .....	2
2.1 Establishment of Select Committee .....	2
2.2 Establishment of Joint Committee .....	2
2.3 Functions of Joint Committee.....	2
3. Chairperson and Membership .....	3
4. Meetings, Attendance and Recording .....	3
5. Number and Duration of Meetings.....	4
5.1 Joint Committee .....	4
5.2 Select Committee.....	4
6. Witnesses attending before the Committee .....	4
7. Committee Reports Published .....	4
8. Travel .....	5
9. EU Mainstreaming .....	5
APPENDIX 1: Orders of Reference .....	7
APPENDIX 2: Membership .....	13
APPENDIX 3: Meetings of the Joint Committee .....	14
APPENDIX 4: Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Committee.....	20
APPENDIX 5: Meetings of the Dáil Select Committee .....	55
APPENDIX 6: Proceedings of the Select Committee .....	57

## **1. Content and Format of Report**

This report has been prepared pursuant to Standing Order 89 (3), (4), (5) and (6) (Dáil Éireann) and Standing Order 76 (3), (4), (5) and (6) (Seanad Éireann) which provide for the Joint Committee to:

- undertake a review of its procedure and its role generally;
- prepare an annual work programme;
- lay minutes of its proceedings before both Houses;
- make an annual report to both Houses.

At its meeting on 16 April 2019, the Joint Committee agreed that all these items should be included in this report covering the period from January 2018 to December 2018.

## **2. Establishment and Functions**

### *2.1 Establishment of Select Committee*

The Dáil Select Committee was established by Order of Dáil Éireann of the 15 June 2016, to consider Bills, Estimates for Public Services, Motions, and the terms of any international agreement involving a charge on public funds, which come within the aegis of the Department on Business, Enterprise and Innovation.

The Select Committee may also consider Annual Output Statements, Value for Money Reviews and Policy Reviews prepared by the relevant Government Department.

### *2.2 Establishment of Joint Committee*

The Dáil Select Committee, under the same Order, was enjoined with a Select Committee of Seanad Éireann, established by Order of Seanad Éireann of the 21 July 2016, to form the Joint Committee on Business, Enterprise and Innovation.

### *2.3 Functions of Joint Committee*

Among the principal functions of the Joint Committee are to consider:

- public affairs administered by the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation;
- matters of policy for which the Minister of Business, Enterprise and Innovation is responsible;

- legislative and expenditure proposals of the Department;
- EU legislative proposals;
- certain matters relating to bodies under the aegis of the Department of Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation.

The Orders of Reference of the Dáil Select Committee and the Joint Committee are set out at Appendix 1.

### **3. Chairperson and Membership**

Dáil SO 93(2) provides for a proportion of Chairs to be allocated to each group by means of the D'Hondt System. Deputy Mary Butler was appointed as Chairperson of the Select Committee on the 16 June 2016 by an Order of Dáil Éireann. The Chairperson of the Select Committee is also the Chairperson of the Joint Committee.

Membership of the Committee, including all internal changes within the reported period, is listed at Appendix 2.

### **4. Meetings, Attendance and Recording**

Meetings of the Joint Committee and Select Committee took place in the Committee rooms in Leinster House 2000. Meetings were in public unless otherwise ordered by the Committee.

Committee proceedings were broadcast live within Leinster House and also made available to RTÉ, TV3 and TG4. Proceedings were also webcast making them available worldwide on the internet. Since September 2014 the proceedings of Committees in public session, typically recorded but occasionally live, are broadcast on the dedicated parliamentary channel Oireachtas TV which is available on the following channels:

- Saorview 22, Sky 517, Virgin Media 207, Eir Vision 504;
- Vodafone Channels 217, 207 and 208.

An Official Report (Parliamentary Debates) of the public meetings of the Committee may be viewed on the Houses of the Oireachtas website at [www.oireachtas.ie](http://www.oireachtas.ie).

Copies of other reports published by the Joint Committee are also available on the Oireachtas Committee website pages at [www.oireachtas.ie](http://www.oireachtas.ie). A list of these reports is set out in section 7.

## **5. Number and Duration of Meetings**

### *5.1 Joint Committee*

The Joint Committee met on 18 occasions during the period under report. The number of hours of discussion involved in these meetings was 29.55 hours.

The subject matter of each meeting of the Joint Committee, including the groups, organisations or individuals who attended the meetings, is detailed in Appendix 3. The Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Committee in public session are attached at *Appendix 4*.

### *5.2 Select Committee*

The Dáil Select Committee met 8 times during the period under report and the number of hours of discussion involved in these meetings was 4.61 hours.

The subject matter of each meeting, including the groups, organisations or individuals who attended the meetings of the Select Committee, is detailed in Appendix 5. The proceedings (Imeachtaí) of the Select Committee are attached at Appendix 6.

## **6. Witnesses attending before the Committee**

During the period, the number of speaking witnesses that appeared before the Joint Committee was 68.

## **7. Committee Reports Published**

During the period under report, the Joint Committee published the following reports:

- Report on the Scrutiny of the Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2017 [PMB]
- Report on the Cost of Doing Business
- South East Action Plan for Jobs: Waterford Engagement

- Annual Report 2017

## 8. Travel

The Joint Committee undertook the following travel in accordance with its Orders of Reference in connection with its Work Programme:

Purpose of travel:	To meet with representatives and SME customers of the German Sparkassen Group
Date and Destination:	21 October – 22 October, Stuttgart
Members travelling:	Deputy Noel Rock Senator James Reilly

## 9. EU Mainstreaming

### 9.1 Legislative Proposals

From January to December 2018, the Joint Committee considered EU matters at 9 meetings involving consideration of some 94 legislative proposals, of which further action or scrutiny was taken on the following 9 proposals:

PROPOSAL NO.	PROPOSAL TITLE
<a href="#">COM(2017)637</a>	Amended proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on certain aspects concerning contracts for the sales of goods, amending Regulation (EC) No 2006/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Directive 2009/22/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council and repealing Directive 1999/44/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council (Text with EEA relevance) {SWD(2017) 354 final} ['online and other distance' removed from title]
<a href="#">COM(2017)795</a>	Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down rules and procedures for compliance with and enforcement of Union harmonisation legislation on products and amending Regulations (EU) No 305/2011, (EU) No 528/2012, (EU) 2016/424, (EU) 2016/425, (EU) 2016/426 and (EU) 2017/1369 of the European Parliament and of the Council, and Directives 2004/42/EC, 2009/48/EC, 2010/35/EU, 2013/29/EU, 2013/53/EU, 2014/28/EU, 2014/29/EU, 2014/30/EU, 2014/31/EU, 2014/32/EU, 2014/33/EU, 2014/34/EU, 2014/35/EU, 2014/53/EU, 2014/68/EU and 2014/90/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council (Text with EEA relevance) {SWD(2017) 466 final} - {SWD(2017) 467 final} - {SWD(2017) 468 final} - {SWD(2017) 469 final} - {SWD(2017) 470 final}
<a href="#">COM(2018)185</a>	Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Council Directive 93/13/EEC of 5 April 1993, Directive 98/6/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, Directive 2005/29/EC of the

	European Parliament and of the Council and Directive 2011/83/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards better enforcement and modernisation of EU consumer protection rules (Text with EEA relevance)
<a href="#">COM(2018)238</a>	Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on promoting fairness and transparency for business users of online intermediation services (Text with EEA relevance) {SEC(2018) 209 final} - {SWD(2018) 138 final} - {SWD(2018) 139 final}
<a href="#">COM(2018)317</a>	Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Regulation (EC) No 469/2009 concerning the supplementary protection certificate for medicinal products (Text with EEA relevance) {SEC(2018) 246 final} - {SWD(2018) 240 final} - {SWD(2018) 241 final} - {SWD(2018) 242 final}
<a href="#">COM(2018)194</a>	Proposal for a Council Decision on the conclusion of the Investment Protection Agreement between the European Union and its Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of Singapore of the other part
<a href="#">COM(2018)195</a>	Proposal for a Council Decision on the signing, on behalf of the European Union, of the Investment Protection Agreement between the European Union and its Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of Singapore of the other part
<a href="#">COM(2018)693</a>	Proposal for a Council Decision on the conclusion of the Investment Protection Agreement between the European Union and its Member States, of the one part, and the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam, of the other part
<a href="#">COM(2018)694</a>	Proposal for a Council Decision on the signing, on behalf of the European Union, of the Investment Protection Agreement between the European Union and its Member States, of the one part, and the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam, of the other part



## **APPENDIX 1: Orders of Reference**

*a) Scope and Context of Activities of Committees (derived from Standing Orders – DSO 84, SSO 70)*

- 1) The Joint Committee may only consider such matters, engage in such activities, exercise such powers and discharge such functions as are specifically authorised under its orders of reference and under Standing Orders;
- 2) Such matters, activities, powers and functions shall be relevant to, and shall arise only in the context of, the preparation of a report to the Dáil/and or Seanad;
- 3) The Joint Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Committee of Public Accounts pursuant to Standing Order 186 and/or the Comptroller and Auditor General (Amendment) Act 1993;
- 4) The Joint Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Joint Committee on Public Petitions in the exercise of its functions under Standing Order 111A; and

The Joint Committee shall refrain from inquiring into in public session or publishing confidential information regarding any matter if so requested, for stated reasons given in writing, by—

- (i) a member of the Government or a Minister of State, or
- (ii) the principal office-holder of a body under the aegis of a Department or which is partly or wholly funded by the State or established or appointed by a member of the Government or by the Oireachtas:

Provided that the Chairman may appeal any such request made to the Ceann Comhairle, whose decision shall be final.

- 5) It shall be an instruction to all Select Committees to which Bills are referred that they shall ensure that not more than two Select Committees shall meet to consider a Bill on any given day, unless the Dáil, after due notice given by the Chairman of the Select Committee, waives this instruction on motion made by the Taoiseach pursuant to Standing Order 28. The Chairmen of Select Committees shall have responsibility for compliance with this instruction. *b) Functions of Departmental Committees (derived from Standing Orders – DSO 84A and SSO 70A)*

(1) The Select Committee shall consider and report to the Dáil on-

*(a)* such aspects of the expenditure, administration and policy of a Government Department or Departments and associated public bodies as the Committee may select, and

*(b)* European Union matters within the remit of the relevant Department or Departments.

(2) The Select Committee may be joined with a Select Committee appointed by Seanad Éireann for the purposes of the functions set out in this Standing Order, other than at paragraph (3), and to report thereon to both Houses of the Oireachtas.

(3) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Select Committee shall consider, in respect of the relevant Department or Departments, such—

- (a) Bills,
- (b) proposals contained in any motion, including any motion within the meaning of Standing Order 187,
- (c) Estimates for Public Services, and
- (d) other matters

as shall be referred to the Select Committee by the Dáil, and

- (e) Annual Output Statements including performance, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of public moneys, and
- (f) such Value for Money and Policy Reviews as the Select Committee may select.

(4) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Joint Committee may consider the following matters in respect of the relevant Department or Departments and associated public bodies:

- (a) matters of policy and governance for which the Minister is officially responsible,
- (b) public affairs administered by the Department,
- (c) policy issues arising from Value for Money and Policy Reviews conducted or commissioned by the Department,
- (d) Government policy and governance in respect of bodies under the aegis of the Department,
- (e) policy and governance issues concerning bodies which are partly or wholly funded by the State or which are established or appointed by a member of the Government or the Oireachtas,
- (f) the general scheme or draft heads of any Bill
- (g) any post-enactment report laid before either House or both Houses by a member of the Government or Minister of State on any Bill enacted by the Houses of the Oireachtas,
- (h) statutory instruments, including those laid or laid in draft before either House or both Houses and those made under the European Communities Acts 1972 to 2009,
- (i) strategy statements laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas pursuant to the Public Service Management Act 1997,

- (j) annual reports or annual reports and accounts, required by law, and laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas, of the Department or bodies referred to in subparagraphs (d) and (e) and the overall performance and operational results, statements of strategy and corporate plans of such bodies, and
  - (k) such other matters as may be referred to it by the Dáil from time to time.
- (5) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Joint Committee shall consider, in respect of the relevant Department or Departments—
  - (a) EU draft legislative acts standing referred to the Select Committee under Standing Order 114, including the compliance of such acts with the principle of subsidiarity,
  - (b) other proposals for EU legislation and related policy issues, including programmes and guidelines prepared by the European Commission as a basis of possible legislative action,
  - (c) non-legislative documents published by any EU institution in relation to EU policy matters, and
  - (d) matters listed for consideration on the agenda for meetings of the relevant EU Council of Ministers and the outcome of such meetings.
- (6) Where the Select Committee has been joined with a Select Committee appointed by Seanad Éireann, the Chairman of the Dáil Select Committee shall also be the Chairman of the Joint Committee.
- (7) The following may attend meetings of the Select or Joint Committee, for the purposes of the functions set out in paragraph (5) and may take part in proceedings without having a right to vote or to move motions and amendments:
  - (a) members of the European Parliament elected from constituencies in Ireland, including Northern Ireland,
  - (b) members of the Irish delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, and
  - (c) at the invitation of the Committee, other members of the European Parliament.
- (8) The Joint Committee may, in respect of any Ombudsman charged with oversight of public services within the policy remit of the relevant Department or Departments, consider—
  - (a) such motions relating to the appointment of an Ombudsman as may be referred to the Committee, and
  - (b) such Ombudsman reports laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas as the Committee may select.

B) *Powers of Committees [derived from Standing Orders – DSO 85, 114 and 116 and SSO 71, 107 and 109]*

The Joint Committee has:-

- (1) power to take oral and written evidence and to print and publish from time to time minutes of such evidence taken in public before the Committee together with such related documents as the Committee thinks fit;
- (2) power to invite and accept oral presentations and written submissions from interested persons or bodies;
- (3) power to appoint sub-Committees and to refer to such sub-Committees any matter comprehended by its orders of reference and to delegate any of its powers to such sub-Committees, including power to report directly to the Dáil and to the Seanad;
- (4) power to draft recommendations for legislative change and for new legislation;
- (4A) power to examine any statutory instrument, including those laid or laid in draft before either House or both Houses and those made under the European Communities Acts 1972 to 2009, and to recommend, where it considers that such action is warranted, whether the instrument should be annulled or amended;
- (4B) for the purposes of paragraph (4A), power to require any Government Department or instrument-making authority concerned to submit a Memorandum to the Committee explaining any statutory instrument under consideration or to attend a meeting of the Committee for the purpose of explaining any such statutory instrument: Provided that such Department or authority may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil;
- (5) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Committee to discuss policy for which he or she is officially responsible: Provided that a member of the Government or Minister of State may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil and Seanad: and provided further that a member of the Government or Minister of State may request to attend a meeting of the Committee to enable him or her to discuss such policy;
- (6) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Committee to discuss proposed primary or secondary legislation (prior to such legislation being published) for which he or she is officially responsible: Provided that a member of the Government or Minister of State may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil and Seanad: and provided further that a member of the Government or Minister of State may request to attend a meeting of the Committee to enable him or her to discuss such proposed legislation;
- (6A) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Committee and provide, in private session if so requested by the member of the Government or Minister of State, oral briefings in advance of meetings of the relevant EU Council of Ministers to enable the Committee to make known its views: Provided that the Committee may also require such attendance following such meetings;

- (6B) power to require that the Chairperson designate of a body or agency under the aegis of a Department shall, prior to his or her appointment, attend before the Committee to discuss his or her strategic priorities for the role;
- (6C) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State who is officially responsible for the implementation of an Act shall attend before a Committee in relation to the consideration of a report under DSO 164A and SSO 157A;
- (7) subject to any constraints otherwise prescribed by law, power to require that principal office-holders in bodies in the State which are partly or wholly funded by the State or which are established or appointed by members of the Government or by the Oireachtas shall attend meetings of the Committee, as appropriate, to discuss issues for which they are officially responsible: Provided that such an office-holder may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Committee, which may report thereon to the relevant House(s);
- (8) power to engage, subject to the consent of the Houses of the Oireachtas Commission, the services of persons with specialist or technical knowledge, to assist it or any of its sub-Committees in considering particular matters; and
- (9) power to undertake travel, subject to—
  - (a) such recommendations as may be made by the Working Group of Committee Chairmen under DSO 108(4)(a) and SSO 104(2) (a); and
  - (b) the consent of the Houses of the Oireachtas Commission, and normal accounting procedures.

In accordance with Articles 6 and 8 of Protocol No. 2 to the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (Protocol on the Application of the Principles of Subsidiarity and Proportionality) as applied by sections 7(3) and 7(4) of the European Union Act 2009, the Committee has the power-

- (a) to consider whether any act of an institution of the European Union infringes the principle of subsidiarity [DSO 116; SSO 109]; and
- (b) to form a reasoned opinion that a draft legislative act (within the meaning of Article 3 of the said Protocol) does not comply with the principle of subsidiarity [DSO 114 and SSO 107].

In addition the Joint Committee on Justice and Equality has the power to consider such notifications, as may be referred to it, re measures concerning family law with cross-boarder implications as applied by section 7(2) of the European Union Act 2009. [DSO 115(1)(b) and SSO 108(1)(b)].

*C) Scope and context of activities of Oireachtas Committees*

In addition to the powers and functions that are given to Committees when they are established, all Oireachtas Committees must operate within the scope and context of activities in Dáil Standing Order 84 and Seanad Standing Order 70 as set out below.

- A Committee may only consider such matters, engage in such activities, exercise such powers and discharge such functions as are specifically authorised under its orders of reference and under Standing Orders;
- Such matters, activities, powers and functions shall be relevant to, and shall arise only in the context of, the preparation of a report to the relevant House(s).
- A Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Committee of Public Accounts pursuant to DSO 186 and/or the Comptroller and Auditor General (Amendment) Act 1993;
- A Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Joint Committee on Public Petitions in the exercise of its functions under DSO 111A(1); and
- A Committee shall refrain from inquiring into in public session or publishing confidential information regarding any matter if so requested, for stated reasons given in writing, by—

(i) a member of the Government or a Minister of State, or

(ii) the principal office-holder of a body under the aegis of a Department or which is partly or wholly funded by the State or established or appointed by a member of the Government or by the Oireachtas:

Provided that the Chairman may appeal any such request made to the Ceann Comhairle, whose decision shall be final.

## **APPENDIX 2: Membership**

### **List of Members on the Joint Committee**

*(The Select Committee membership comprises of Deputies only)*

**Chairperson:**        *Mary Butler (FF)*

**Deputies:**            *Lisa Chambers (FF)*  
                              *Billy Kelleher (FF)*  
                              *James Lawless (FF)*  
                              *Tom Neville (FG)*  
                              *Maurice Quinlivan (SF)*  
                              *Noel Rock (FG)*

**Senators:**            *Aidan Davitt (FF)*  
                              *Pádraig Mac Lochlainn (SF)*  
                              *Kevin Humphreys (LAB)*  
                              *James Reilly (FG)*

#### **Notes:**

1. Deputies appointed to the Committee by order of the Dáil on 16 June 2016.
2. Deputy Mary Butler was appointed as Chair on 16 June 2016.
3. Senators appointed to the Committee by order of the Seanad on 21 July 2016.
4. Deputy Gino Kenny replaced Deputy Bríd Smith on 26 October 2017.
5. Senator Kevin Humphreys replaced Senator Ged Nash on 16 November 2017.
6. Deputy James Lawless replaced Deputy Gino Kenny on the 20 February 2018.
7. Deputy Billy Kelleher replaced Deputy Niall Collins on the 17 April 2018.
8. Deputy Lisa Chambers replaced Deputy Stephen Donnelly on 17 April 2018.
9. Deputy Tom Neville elected as Vice Chair on 24 April 2018.
10. Senator Pádraig Mac Lochlainn replaced Senator Paul Gavan on 9 October 2018.

### APPENDIX 3: Meetings of the Joint Committee

The following are the details, in date order, of the scheduled meetings of the Joint Committee which took place during the period under report.

<b>Meeting No. and Date</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended</b>
J28 16/01/2018	Private Meeting	N/A
J29 30/01/2018	Cost of Business (Resumed)	<p><i>Banking &amp; Payments Federation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Felix O'Regan</li> </ul> <p><i>Bank of Ireland</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Michael Lahouff</li> <li>• Ms June Butler</li> </ul> <p><i>Allied Irish Bank</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Catherine Moroney</li> <li>• Ms Margaret Brennan</li> </ul> <p><i>Irish League of Credit Unions</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Ed Farrell</li> </ul> <p><i>Credit Union Development Association</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Kevin Johnson</li> </ul> <p><i>Credit Union Managers Association</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Tim Molan</li> </ul> <p><i>Sparkassen</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Harald Felzen</li> </ul> <p><i>Irish Rural Link</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Seamus Boland</li> <li>• Ms Sinead Dooley</li> </ul>
J30 13/02/2018	Further Scrutiny of EU Proposals and Sectoral Employment Order	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Pat Breen, Minister of State for Trade, Employment Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection</li> </ul> <p><i>Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Kieran Grace</li> <li>• Ms Colette Reilly</li> <li>• Mr Sean Smith</li> </ul> <p><i>Competition and Consumer Protection Commission</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Isolde Goggin</li> <li>• Mr Patrick Kenny</li> <li>• Ms Una Butler</li> </ul>
J31 21/02/2018	Private Meeting	N/A



Meeting No. and Date	Topic	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J32 27/02/2018	Update on Preparations for Brexit	<i>Inter Trade Ireland</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Kerry Curran</li> <li>• Mr Mark Sterritt</li> </ul> <i>IDA Ireland</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Mary Buckley</li> <li>• Mr Kieran Donoghue</li> </ul> <i>Enterprise Ireland</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Kevin Sherry</li> <li>• Ms Anne Lanigan</li> </ul>
J33 27/03/2018	Engagement with Chair Designate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr James Kennedy NSAI</li> </ul>
J34 18/04/2018	Cost of Doing Business (Resumed)	<i>The Alliance for Insurance Reform</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Eoin Mc Cambridge</li> <li>• Ms Stephanie Reid</li> <li>• Mr Ivan Cooper</li> <li>• Mr Peter Boland</li> </ul>
J35 24/04/2018	Cost of Doing Business (Resumed) / Crime	<i>Irish Pharmacy Union</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Daragh Connolly</li> <li>• Ms Ann-Marie Horan</li> <li>• Mr Jim Curran</li> </ul> <i>Association of Fine Jewellers</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Damian Duggan</li> </ul>
J36 8/05/2018	Cost of Doing Business (Resumed)	<i>Insurance Ireland</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Kevin Thompson</li> <li>• Mr Declan Jackson</li> <li>• Mr Michael Horan</li> </ul> <i>International Small Business Alliance</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Seamus Maye</li> <li>• Mr Gerry Duddy</li> <li>• Mr Jerry Beades</li> </ul>

<b>Meeting No. and Date</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended</b>
J37 22/05/2018	Scrutiny of the Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2018	<p><i>Scrutiny of PMB</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Deputy Maurice Quinlivan</li> <li>• Mr David Mc Fadden</li> </ul> <p><i>Department of Business, Enterprise And Innovation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Kieran Grace</li> <li>• Mr Bill Cox</li> </ul>
J38 19/06/2018	Statement of Strategy 2018-2021	<p><i>Secretary General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dr Orlaigh Quinn</li> </ul> <p><i>Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ms Breda Power</li> <li>• Mr Dermot Mulligan</li> <li>• Mr David Hegarty</li> </ul>
J39 03/07/2018	Private Meeting	N/A
J40 18/09/2018	Private Meeting	N/A
J41 2/10/2018	Consumer Protection (Amendment) Bill 2017 PMB	<p><i>Bill Sponsor</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Niall Collins, T.D.</li> </ul> <p><i>Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Kieran Grace, Principal Officer, Competition &amp; Consumer Policy Section</li> <li>• Bill Cox, Assistant Principal Officer, Competition &amp; Consumer Policy Section</li> <li>• Emma Hanrahan, Executive Officer, Competition &amp; Consumer Policy Section.</li> </ul>

Meeting No. and Date	Topic	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J42 16/10/2018	Meeting on CERN	<p data-bbox="815 266 1337 331"><i>Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul data-bbox="868 342 1353 831" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 342 1353 443">• Ms. Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation</li> <li data-bbox="868 472 1353 611">• Ms. Breda Power, Assistant Secretary for Commerce, Consumer and Competition Division, DBEI.</li> <li data-bbox="868 640 1353 741">• Ms. Síona Ryan Competition Policy, Product Safety and CCPC Liaison</li> <li data-bbox="868 770 1353 831">• Mr. Paddy Mulligan DBEI (Public Gallery)</li> </ul> <p data-bbox="868 902 1315 967">"Conseil Européen pour la Recherche Nucléaire",</p> <p data-bbox="868 987 1374 1048">or European Council for Nuclear Research - CERN</p> <ul data-bbox="868 1070 1374 1630" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 1070 1374 1104">• Prof. Ronan Mc Nulty – UCD</li> <li data-bbox="868 1126 1374 1227">• Dr. Sheila Gilheany, Policy Officer for the Institute of Physics in Ireland</li> <li data-bbox="868 1249 1374 1283">• Mr. Ed Hendrick, CEO of Sonru</li> <li data-bbox="868 1305 1374 1384">• Prof. Brendan McClean, St. Luke's Hospital, Rathgar</li> <li data-bbox="868 1406 1374 1507">• Prof. Val O'Shea, Physics Department, University of Glasgow, UK</li> <li data-bbox="868 1529 1374 1630">• Prof. Sinead Ryan, School of Mathematics, Trinity College Dublin</li> </ul>

Meeting No. and Date	Topic	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J44 7/11/2018	Pre-legislative scrutiny on the Industrial Development Bill 2018	<p><i>Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mr Richard Scannell (DBEI)</li> <li>• Mr Marcus Breathnach (DBEI)</li> <li>• Mr Kevin Sherry (Enterprise Ireland)</li> <li>• Mr Paul McKeown (Enterprise Ireland)</li> <li>• Ms Mary Buckley (IDA Ireland)</li> <li>• Ms Sarah O’Connell (IDA Ireland)</li> </ul>
J45 13/11/2018	Ireland’s Skills Needs	<p><i>Irish Congress for Trade Unions - ICTU</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dr Peter Rigney</li> <li>• Dr Laura Bambrick</li> </ul> <p><i>IBEC</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tony Donohoe, Head of Education and Social Policy</li> <li>• Una Fitzpatrick, Director, Technology Ireland,</li> <li>• Sinead Keogh, Director, Medtech and Engineering</li> <li>• Claire McGee, Ibec Senior Innovation and Education Executive</li> <li>• Siobhán Dean Biopharmachem Ireland Executive</li> </ul>

Meeting No. and Date	Topic	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J46 27/11/2018	Ireland's Skills Needs (resumed)	<p data-bbox="815 264 1331 331"><i>Department of Business Enterprise and Innovation</i></p> <ul data-bbox="868 376 1374 573" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 376 1347 483">• Ms Clare Dunne, Assistant Secretary, Workplace Regulation and Economic Migration,</li> <li data-bbox="868 501 1374 573">• Mr Rob Walsh, Assistant Principal, Employment Permits Section</li> </ul> <p data-bbox="815 622 916 656"><i>SOLAS</i></p> <ul data-bbox="868 696 1347 896" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 696 1331 768">• Ms Mary-Liz Trant, Executive Director for Skills Development</li> <li data-bbox="868 786 1347 896">• Mr Andrew Brownlee, Executive Director for Strategy and Knowledge</li> </ul> <p data-bbox="815 913 922 947"><i>EGFSN</i></p> <ul data-bbox="868 954 1358 1189" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 954 1331 1061">• Mr Tony Donohoe, Chair of the Expert Group on Future Skills Needs</li> <li data-bbox="868 1079 1358 1189">• Mr Kevin Daly, Principal Officer, EGFSN secretariat, Skills &amp; Education Unit</li> </ul> <p data-bbox="815 1207 1098 1240"><i>APPRENTICESHIPS</i></p> <ul data-bbox="868 1247 1086 1335" style="list-style-type: none"> <li data-bbox="868 1247 1082 1281">• Laura Regan</li> <li data-bbox="868 1299 1086 1335">• Paddy Power</li> </ul>

**APPENDIX 4: Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Committee**  
**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**  
**Minutes of 16 January 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 4pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

**2. Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Senators Paul Gavan, Aidan Davitt and Deputies

Stephen Donnelly, Niall Collins and Gino Kenny.

**Private Session**

**3. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**4. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**5. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**6. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**7. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**8. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**9. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**10. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**11. Item discussed in Private Session.**

**12. Item discussed in Private Session**

**13. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.44pm until Tuesday, 30<sup>th</sup> January 2018 at 3pm.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**30<sup>th</sup> January 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 30<sup>th</sup> January 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 3.04pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Niall Collins, Stephen Donnelly, Gino Kenny, Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan and Noel Rock.

Senators: Paul Daly, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Senator Paul Daly substituted for Senator Aidan Davitt.

Apologies were received from Deputy Stephen Donnelly and Senator Aidan Davitt.

#### **Private Session**

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

#### **Public Session 4.06pm**

7. **Cost of Doing Business (Resumed) – Session 1**

The Chair welcomed:-

- **Mr Felix O'Regan** from the Banking and Payments Federation of Ireland
- **Mr Michael Lauhoff** Director of Business Banking and **Ms June Butler**, Head of SME Banking, with Bank of Ireland
- **Ms Catherine Moroney** Head of Business Banking and **Ms Margaret Brennan**, Head of SME Sector Strategy with Allied Irish Bank

to the meeting to discuss the cost of doing Business.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

*The Committee suspended at 5.31pm*

**[Public Session – 5.41pm]**

**8. *Cost of Doing Business (Resumed) – Session 2***

The Chair welcomed:-

- Mr Ed Farrell CEO of the Irish League of Credit Unions
- Mr Kevin Johnson CEO of the Credit Union Development Association
- Mr Tim Molan Chairperson of the Credit Union Managers Association
- Mr Seamus Boland CEO (IRL) and Ms Sinead Dooley of Irish Rural Link
- Mr Harald Felzen of Savings Bank for International Cooperation (Sparkasse)

to the meeting to discuss the cost of doing Business.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

**9. *Adjournment.***

The Joint Committee adjourned at 7.03pm until Tuesday, **13<sup>th</sup> February 2018 at 4pm.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**13<sup>th</sup> February 2018**



## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 13<sup>th</sup> February 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 4.15pm in Committee Room 1, Leinster House 2000.

Attendance.

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair) and Deputy Tom Neville.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Paul Gavan, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputies Maurice Quinlivan, Niall Collins and Stephen Donnelly.

#### **2. Consideration of Sectoral Employment Order (Mechanical Engineering Building Services Contracting Sector) 2018**

The Chair welcomed Minister Pat Breen and his officials and invited him to make a brief opening statement. This was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

It was agreed that the Clerk to the Committee would convey the following message to the Clerk of the Dáil and the Clerk of the Seanad:

"The Joint Committee on Jobs Enterprise and innovation has completed its consideration of the following Sectoral Employment Order (Mechanical Engineering Building Services Contracting Sector) 2018."

**[Private Session 4.27pm]**

- 3. Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 4. Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 5. Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 6. Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 7. Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee Suspended at 5.10pm*

**[Public Session 5.12pm]**

- 8. Scrutiny of EU Proposals Schedule A - COM(2017) 795** The Committee agreed that this proposal warrants further scrutiny. It was also agreed to request a further note from the Department outlining in greater detail:
- The possible subsidiarity concerns surrounding the Union Product Compliance network;
  - If it is envisaged that the proposal will have a financial implication for Ireland;
  - The extent to which statutory instruments may be required;
  - What option (referred to in Article 14(2) of the proposal) is in use in Ireland and if it will have any impact on the effectiveness of the proposal in Ireland.
- 9. Further Scrutiny of COM (2017) 142 - Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council to empower the competition authorities of the Member States to be more effective enforcers and to ensure the proper functioning of the internal market.**

*The Chair welcomed:-*

- Mr. Kieran Grace, Principal Officer,
- Ms. Colette Reilly, Assistant Principal Officer, *and*
- Mr. Sean Smith, Higher Executive Officer

*The Chair also welcomed:-*

- Ms Isolde Goggin, Chairperson
- Mr Patrick Kenny, Member of the Commission, *and*
- Ms Úna Butler, Director of Legal Services

Following an opening statement from officials a question and answer session with Members ensued.

*The Committee Suspended at 5.41pm*

[Private Session 5.41pm]

**10. Decision on COM (2017) 142 -**

The members agreed that they are satisfied with Further Scrutiny of COM (2017) 142 and agreed to close scrutiny

**11. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.43pm until Tuesday, **21<sup>st</sup> February 2018 at 1.30pm.**



---

**Mary Butler,  
Chair,  
27th February 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 21st February 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 1.33pm in Committee Room 3, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Niall Collins, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Paul Gavan, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

4. **Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 2.04pm until Tuesday, 27<sup>th</sup> February 2018 at 4pm.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**27th February 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**  
**Minutes of 27<sup>th</sup> February 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 4.01pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), James Lawless, Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Paul Gavan, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Niall Collins and Deputy Stephen Donnelly

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
8. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
9. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

**[Public Session]**

10. **Scrutiny of EU Proposals**

It was agreed that there is no subsidiarity concern with COM (2017) 795. It was also agreed that this proposal does not warrant further scrutiny.

11. **Update on Preparations for Brexit**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Ms. Kerry Curran, Strategy & Policy Manager and Mr. Mark Sterritt, Brexit Manager, InterTradeIreland;
- Ms. Mary Buckley, Executive Director, & Mr. Kieran Donoghue, Global Head of International Financial Services, IDA Ireland; and
- Mr Kevin Sherry, Executive Director, Global Business Development, and Ms Anne Lanigan, Brexit Manager, Enterprise Ireland

to the meeting to update the Committee on their preparations for Brexit.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

**12. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.04pm until Wednesday, **18<sup>th</sup> April 2018 at 1.30pm.**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mary Butler", written in a cursive style. The signature is positioned above a horizontal line.

---

**Mary Butler  
Chair  
27<sup>th</sup> March 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**  
**Minutes of 27<sup>th</sup> March 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.06pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Niall Collins and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Tom Neville.

**[Private Session]**

- 3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

**[Public Session]**

*The Committee resumed at 4.11pm*

6. **Engagement with Chairperson Designate of the National Standards Authority of Ireland (NSAI)**

The Chair welcomed:-

Mr James Kennedy, Chairperson Designate of the National Standards Authority of Ireland to the meeting.

Mr Kennedy made his opening statement which was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

**It was agreed that the Clerk would write to the Minister stating that the Committee had concluded its engagement with Mr. Kennedy.**

**7. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 4.22 p.m. until Wednesday, **18<sup>th</sup> April 2018 at 1.30pm.**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mary Butler", written in a cursive style. The signature is positioned above a solid horizontal line.

**Mary Butler  
Chair  
18<sup>th</sup> April 2018**



**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 18<sup>th</sup> April 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 1.36pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

**2. Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Billy Kelleher, James Lawless, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt (in the Chair) and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Senators Paul Gavan and Kevin Humphreys.

**3. Election of Temporary Chairperson**

In the unavoidable absence of the Chair, the Clerk sought nominations for a temporary chair. Senator Aidan Davitt was nominated by Senator James Reilly and agreed by the Committee. Senator Davitt took the chair accordingly.

*The Committee suspended at 1.36pm*

**Private Session 1.37pm**

4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 1.43pm*

**Public Session 1.45pm**

**8. Cost of Doing Business (Resumed)**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Mr. Eoin Mc Cambridge, Managing Director of Mc Cambridges of Galway
- Ms. Stephanie Reid, Owner of Monkey Business Play Centre
- Mr. Ivan Cooper, Director of Public Policy at the Wheel
- Mr. Peter Boland, Director of The Alliance for Insurance Reform

to the meeting to discuss the cost of doing Business.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

**9. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 2.50pm until Tuesday, **24<sup>th</sup> April 2018 at 4 p.m.**

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Mary Butler".

---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**24<sup>th</sup> April 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 24<sup>th</sup> April 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.11pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Lisa Chambers, Billy Kelleher and Tom Neville.

Senator: James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Maurice Quinlivan and Senators Paul Gavan and Aidan Davitt.

In accordance with Dáil Standing Order 95(3) Deputy John Brassil and Senator Pádraig Ó Céidigh attended the meeting.

*The Committee went into Private Session 16.12pm*

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.17pm*

*The Committee went into Public Session 4.19pm*

7. **Election of Vice-Chairperson [SO 93(3)]**

In accordance with Standing Orders, the Chair requested a nomination for Vice Chairperson of the Joint Committee.

Senator James Reilly nominated Deputy Tom Neville. As there were no further nominations, the Chair declared Deputy Tom Neville to be Vice-Chairperson.

*The Committee suspended at 4.19pm*

*The Committee resumed in Public Session at 4.21pm*

## 8. Cost of Doing Business (Resumed)

The Chair welcomed:-

From the Irish Pharmacy Union -

- Mr. Daragh Connolly, IPU President;
- Ms. Ann-Marie Horan, IPU Executive Member
- Mr. Jim Curran, IPU Director of Communications & Strategy.

And from the Association of Fine Jewellers -

- Mr Damian Duggan, Secretary/Treasurer, Association Of Fine Jewellers

to the meeting to discuss the cost of doing Business.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

## 9. Adjournment.

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.15pm until Tuesday, 8<sup>th</sup> May 2018 at 4 p.m.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**8<sup>th</sup> May 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 8<sup>th</sup> May 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.09pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Lisa Chambers, James Lawless, Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan and Noel Rock.

Senators: Aidan Davitt and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Senator Paul Gavan.

The Committee went into Private Session at 4.10pm

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.27pm*

#### **Public Session 4.28pm**

8. **Scrutiny of EU Proposals**

**It was agreed that there are no subsidiarity concerns with COM (2018) 171. It was also agreed that the proposal warrants no further scrutiny.**

**It was further agreed that the Schedule B proposals do not warrant further scrutiny.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.28pm*

## **Public Session 4.29pm**

### **9. Cost of Doing Business (Resumed)**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Mr. Kevin Thompson – CEO, Insurance Ireland
- Mr. Declan Jackson – Director of Government Affairs, Insurance Ireland
- Mr. Michael Horan – Non Life Manager, Insurance Ireland
  
- Mr Séamus Maye - International Small Business Alliance
- Mr Gerry Duddy, Secretary to Public Banking Forum of Ireland
- Mr Jerry Beades, Chair of Friends of Banking Ireland

to the meeting to discuss the cost of doing Business.

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

On conclusion the Chair thanked the speakers for engaging with the Committee.

### **10. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.59pm until Tuesday, **22<sup>nd</sup> May 2018 at 4 p.m.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**22 May 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.07pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan and Noel Rock.

Senators: Aidan Davitt and Paul Gavan

Apologies were received from Deputy James Lawless and Senator James Reilly.

The Committee went into Private Session at 4.08pm

3. **Item discussed in Private Session**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.18pm*

#### **Public Session 4.19pm**

6. **Scrutiny of Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2017 [PMB]**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Deputy Maurice Quinlivan, the sponsor of the Bill and
- Mr. David McFadden

to the meeting to scrutinise the **Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2017. [PMB]**

Presentations were made by the attendees and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

On conclusion the Chair thanked the speakers for engaging with the Committee.

*The Committee suspended at 4.43pm*

## **Public Session 4.44pm**

### **7. Scrutiny of Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2017 [PMB]**

The Chair welcomed:-

from the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation –

- Mr Kieran Grace Principal Officer – Competition and Consumer Policy and
- Mr Bill Cox Assistant Principal – Competition and Consumer Policy

to the meeting to scrutinise the **Sale of Tickets (Sporting and Cultural Events) Bill 2017. [PMB]**

A presentation was made by the officials and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

*The Committee suspended at 5.49pm*

## **Private Session 5.49pm**

### **8. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.51pm until Tuesday, **19<sup>th</sup> June 2018 at 4 p.m.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**19 June 2018**



## JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION

### Minutes of 19<sup>th</sup> June 2018

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.03pm in Committee Room 2, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Lisa Chambers, Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville, and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Paul Gavan, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Senator Aidan Davitt.

*The Committee went into Private Session at 4.04pm*

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session..**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.36pm*

#### **Public Session 4.37pm**

7. **Announcement of the Scrutiny of EU Proposals**

It was agreed that there are no subsidiarity concerns with this proposal with **COM(2018) 184**. It was also agreed that this proposal does not warrant further scrutiny.

It was agreed that **COM(2018) 185** warrants further scrutiny. It was also agreed that the Committee request an additional note from the Department outlining in more detail its concerns over the penalties provision in the proposal and how it compares to the current situation in Ireland.

It was agreed that there are no subsidiarity concerns with **COM(2018) 238**. It was also agreed that this proposal warrants further scrutiny. It was agreed to request a note from the Department outlining in more detail the conflict between the injunctive relief proposal and current Irish law.

It was agreed that there are no subsidiarity concerns with this proposal with **COM(2018) 239**. It was also agreed that this proposal does not warrant further scrutiny.

It was agreed that there are no subsidiarity concerns with this proposal with **COM(2018) 241**. It was also agreed that this proposal does not warrant further scrutiny.

*The Committee suspended from 4.37pm until 4.39pm*

#### **8. Strategy Statement of the Department 2018-2021**

The Chair welcomed from the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation –

- Dr. Orlaigh Quinn, Secretary General,
- Ms. Breda Power, Assistant Secretary with responsibility for Consumer, Company Law, Personal Injuries Assessment Board and Competition.
- Mr. Dermot Mulligan, Assistant Secretary with responsibility for Innovation and Investment, and
- Mr. David Hegarty, Assistant Secretary with responsibility for Strategic Policy

to the meeting to discuss the Strategy Statement of the Department 2018-2021 which was published in April.

The Secretary General made a presentation and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

#### **9. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.10pm until Tuesday, **3<sup>rd</sup> July 2018 at 4p.m.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**3 July 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 4.06pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville, and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Paul Gavan and James Reilly.

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

8. **Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.42pm *sine die*.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**18 September 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 18<sup>th</sup> September 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Private Session at 4.11pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Tom Neville (in the Chair), Noel Rock and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Paul Gavan and Kevin Humphreys.

Apologies were received from Deputy Mary Butler (Chair) and Senator James Reilly.

Deputy Eugene Murphy attended in substitution for Deputy Lisa Chambers.

In the unavoidable absence of the Chair, the Vice-Chair, Deputy Tom Neville, took the chair.

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
8. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

9. **Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 4.45pm until **Tuesday 2 October 2018 at 4pm.**



---

**Mary Butler  
Chair  
2 October 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 2<sup>nd</sup> October 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.05pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan and Noel Rock.

Senators: Paul Gavan and Kevin Humphreys.

Apologies were received from Deputy James Lawless and Senator James Reilly.

*The Committee went into Private Session at 4.06pm*

- 3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
- 7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.18pm*

**Public Session 4.21pm**

8. **Scrutiny of the Consumer Protection (Amendment) Bill 2017**

The Chair welcomed Deputy Niall Collins, the sponsor of the Bill to the meeting.

Deputy Collins made his presentation to the Committee which was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

*The Committee suspended at 4.58pm*

**Public Session 5pm**

## 9. Scrutiny of the Consumer Protection (Amendment) Bill 2017

The Chair welcomed:-

from the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation –

- Mr Kieran Grace Principal Officer – Competition and Consumer Policy and
  - Mr Bill Cox Assistant Principal – Competition and Consumer Policy
  - Ms Emma Hanrahan – Executive Officer, Competition and Consumer Policy
- to the meeting.

A presentation was made by the officials and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

*The Committee suspended at 5.26pm and resumed in Private Session.*

## 10. Adjournment.

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.34pm until Tuesday, 16<sup>th</sup> October 2018 at 4p.m.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**16 October 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 16<sup>th</sup> October 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.13pm in Committee Room 4, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Lisa Chambers, Billy Kelleher, James Lawless and Tom Neville.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Pádraig Mac Lochlainn and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Maurice Quinlivan.

3. **New member of the Committee**

The Chair welcomed Senator Pádraig Mac Lochlainn as a new member of the Committee. She thanked Senator Paul Gavan for his contributions and wished him well in his new role.

4. **Competition Act 2002 (Section 27) Order 2018**

The Chair welcomed Minister Heather Humphreys and her officials to the meeting.

Following the opening statement the Chair thanked the Minister for attending and engaging with members.

It was agreed that the Clerk to the Committee convey the following message to the Clerk of the Dáil and the Clerk of the Seanad: -

‘The Joint Committee on Business, Enterprise and Innovation has completed its consideration of the **Competition Act 2002 (Section 27) Order 2018**’.

*The Committee suspended at 4.18pm*

**[Private Session 4.19pm]**

5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
7. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended at 4.35pm*

**[Public Session 4.37pm]**

**8. Possible Opportunities for Scientific and Economic Advantage to Ireland by Joining CERN.**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Professor Ronan Mc Nulty – UCD
- Dr. Sheila Gilheany, Policy Officer for the Institute of Physics in Ireland
- Ed Hendrick, CEO of Sonru
- Prof. Brendan McClean, St. Luke's Hospital, Rathgar
- Prof. Val O'Shea, Physics Department, University of Glasgow, UK
- Prof. Sinead Ryan, School of Mathematics, Trinity College Dublin

to the meeting.

Professor Mc Nulty made a presentation to the Committee and this was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

**9. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 5.32pm until Tuesday, **13<sup>th</sup> November 2018 at 4p.m.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**7 November 2018**



## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 7<sup>th</sup> November 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 5.05pm in Committee Room 1, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan

Senators: Pádraig Mac Lochlainn and Kevin Humphreys.

Apologies were received from Deputy Lisa Chambers.

3. **Deferral of items scheduled in Private Session**

It was agreed to defer items scheduled for consideration in private session until the meeting of 13th November.

4. **Briefing by officials of the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation on the General Scheme of the Industrial Development (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2018.**

The Chair welcomed:-

- Mr Richard Scannell (Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation)
- Mr Marcus Breathnach (Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation)
- Mr Kevin Sherry (Enterprise Ireland)
- Mr Paul McKeown (Enterprise Ireland)
- Ms Mary Buckley (IDA Ireland) and
- Ms Sarah O'Connell (IDA Ireland)

to the meeting.

Mr. Scannell made an opening statement to the Committee.

*Due to a Vote in the Dáil the committee suspended at 5.16pm*

*The committee resumed at 5.51pm*

A question and answer session with Members ensued.

**5. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.31pm until Tuesday, **13<sup>th</sup> November 2018 at 4p.m.**



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**13 November 2018**

## **JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

### **Minutes of 13<sup>th</sup> November 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.06pm in Committee Room 1, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Lisa Chambers, Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Pádraig Mac Lochlainn, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

*The Committee went into Private Session at 4.07pm*

3. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
4. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
5. **Item discussed in Private Session.**
6. **Item discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended from 4.19pm to 4.20pm*

*Public Session*

7. **Announcement of EU Scrutiny decisions**

**Schedule A proposals:**

It was agreed that COM(2018) 194 and 195 warrant further scrutiny

It was agreed that proposals COM(2018) 192, 193, 196,197, 344 and 580 do not warrant further scrutiny.

**Schedule B proposals**

The following proposals were agreed for no further scrutiny.

COM(2018) 206

COM(2018) 264

COM(2018) 316

COM(2018) 343

COM(2018) 398

COM(2018) 546

COM(2018) 571

COM(2018) 573

COM(2018) 574

*The Committee suspended from 4.20pm to 4.22pm*

*Public Session Resumed*

## **8. Ireland's Skills Needs**

The Chair welcomed from the Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU):-

- **Dr Peter Rigney (Industrial Officer) and**
- **Dr Laura Bambrick (Social Policy & Legislative Officer)**

to the meeting.

Dr Rigney made an opening statement to the Committee.

A question and answer session with Members ensued.

*The Committee suspended from 5.14pm to 5.16pm*

*Public Session Resumed*

## **9. Ireland's Skills Needs**

The Chair welcomed from the Irish Business and Employers Confederation (Ibec):-

- **Mr Tony Donohoe, Head of Education and Social Policy**
- **Ms Una Fitzpatrick, Director, Technology Ireland,**
- **Ms Sinead Keogh, Director, Medtech and Engineering**
- **Ms Claire McGee, Ibec Senior Innovation and Education Executive**
- **Ms Siobhán Dean, Biopharmachem Ireland Executive**

to the meeting.

Mr Donohoe made an opening statement to the Committee.

A question and answer session with Members ensued.

Senator Mac Lochlainn requested that IBEC send in a supplementary submission on specific problems they are aware of in relation to the delay in the processing time for work permits and visas being issued to non-EEA workers so that the Committee can discuss these with officials of the Department. He further requested that the submission detail legislative changes that may be required in order to navigate around these blockages in the system.

**10. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.14pm until Tuesday, **27<sup>th</sup> November 2018 at 4p.m.**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mary Butler", written in a cursive style.

---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**27<sup>th</sup> November 2018**

**JOINT COMMITTEE ON BUSINESS, ENTERPRISE AND INNOVATION**

**Minutes of 27<sup>th</sup> November 2018**

1. The Joint Committee met in Public Session at 4.07pm in Committee Room 1, Leinster House 2000.

2. **Attendance.**

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Mary Butler (in the Chair), Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

Senators: Aidan Davitt, Pádraig Mac Lochlainn, Kevin Humphreys and James Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Lisa Chambers.

The Committee went into Private Session at 4.07pm

3. **Item Discussed in Private Session**
4. **Item Discussed in Private Session**
5. **Item Discussed in Private Session.**

*The Committee suspended from 4.15pm to 4.16pm*

*Public Session*

6. **Announcement of EU Scrutiny decisions**

**Schedule A proposals**

It was agreed that COM(2018) 693 & COM (2018) 694 warrant further scrutiny. It was also agreed to request a detailed note on the IPAs with both Singapore and Vietnam and how they relate to the similar CETA proposals, and to request the department to indicate when it is anticipated the CETA and the Vietnam and Singapore IPAs will be brought to the Oireachtas for ratification.

It was agreed that COM(2018) 691 & COM(2018) 692 do not warrant further scrutiny.

It was agreed that the following Schedule B proposals do not warrant further scrutiny:

EWN(2018)C 151-57  
EWN(2018)C 157-3  
EWN(2018)C 162-11  
EWN(2018)C 243-08  
EWN(2018)C 250-8  
EWN(2018)C 253-30  
EWN(2018)C 284-9  
EWN(2018)C 402-6  
EWN(2018)L 113-4  
EWN(2018)L 211-5  
EWN(2018)L 279-17  
EWN(2018)L 79-31  
EWN(2018)L 92-4  
EWN: 2018/C310 /4  
EWN: 2018/C310 /5  
EWN: 2018/C315 /22

*The Committee suspended from 4.17pm to 4.19pm*

*Public Session Resumed*

## **7. Ireland's Skills Needs**

The Chair welcomed: -

### **From SOLAS**

- Ms. Mary-Liz Trant, Executive Director for Skills Development
- Mr. Andrew Brownlee, Executive Director for Strategy and Knowledge

### **From the Expert Group on Future Skills Needs (EGFSN): -**

- Mr Tony Donohoe, Chair of the Expert Group on Future Skills Needs
- Mr Kevin Daly, Principal Officer, EGFSN Secretariat, Skills & Education Unit DBEI

### **From the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation; -**

- Ms Clare Dunne, Assistant Secretary, Workplace Regulation and Economic Migration,
- Mr. Rob Walsh, Assistant Principal, Employment Permits Section

to the meeting.

Following opening statements a question and answer session with Members ensued.

*The Committee suspended from 6.18pm to 6.22pm*

*Public Session Resumed*

**8. Ireland's Skills Needs**

*The Chair welcomed*

- **Ms. Laura Regan**, who has just successfully completed her four year electrical apprenticeship with the ESB. She is now a qualified electrician and has secured a fulltime job with the ESB, *and*
- **Mr. Paddy Power from Wexford**, who is in the final year of his three-year insurance apprenticeship, which leads to a level 8 degree. Paddy was part of the very first intake of the insurance apprenticeship programme.  
to the meeting.

Following opening statements a question and answer session with Members ensued.

On conclusion the Chair thanked the witnesses for attending and engaging with the Committee.

**9. Adjournment.**

The Joint Committee adjourned at 6.48pm *sine die*.



---

**Mary Butler**  
**Chair**  
**22nd November 2018**



## APPENDIX 5: Meetings of the Dáil Select Committee

The following are the details, in date order, of the scheduled meetings of the Select Committee which took place during the period under report.

<b>Meeting No. and Date</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended</b>
S04 09/03/2017	Knowledge Development Box (Certification of Inventions) Bill 2016 [Seanad].	Mr. John Halligan T.D., Minister of State for Training, Skills and Innovation.
S05 28/03/2017	2017 Revised Estimates for the Public Services – Vote 32 - Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation.	Ms. Mary Mitchell O'Connor T.D., Minister for Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation.  Mr. John Halligan T.D., Minister of State for Training, Skills and Innovation.  Mr. Pat Breen T.D., Minister of State for Employment and Small Business.
S06 14/06/2017	Companies (Amendment) Bill 2017. Competition (Amendment) Bill 2016 [Seanad] [PMB].	Ms. Mary Mitchell O'Connor T.D., Minister for Jobs, Enterprise and Innovation.
S07 15/06/2017	Hallmarking (Amendment) Bill 2016.	Ms. Frances Fitzgerald T.D., Tánaiste and Minister for Enterprise and Innovation.
S08 27/09/2017	Legal Metrology (Measuring Instruments) Bill 2017.	Mr. Pat Breen, T.D., Minister of State for Trade, Employment, Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection.
S09 22/11/2017	Further Revised Estimate for the Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2017 – Vote 32 – Business, Enterprise and Innovation.	Mr. Pat Breen, T.D., Minister of State for Trade, Employment, Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection.
S10 06/12/2017	Supplementary Estimate for the Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2017 – Vote 32 – Business, Enterprise and Innovation.	Ms. Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation.
S11 21/02/2018	Committee Stage of Companies (Statutory Audits) Bill 2017	Ms Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation
S12 27/03/2018	Consideration of Revised Estimates 2018 for Vote 32 – Business, Enterprise and Innovation	Ms Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation

		<p>Mr. Pat Breen, T.D., Minister of State for Trade, Employment, Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection</p> <p>Mr. John Halligan, T.D., Minister of State for Training, Skills, Innovation, Research and Development</p>
S13 09/05/2018	Committee Stage consideration of the Industrial Development (Amendment) Bill 2018	Pat Breen, Minister of State for Trade, Employment, Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection
S14 13/06/2018	Committee Stage consideration of the Copyright and Other Intellectual Property Law Provisions Bill 2018	Minister John Halligan, Minister of State for Training, Skills, Innovation, Research and Development.
S15 20/06/2018	Motion on the accession of Ireland to the European Organisation for Astronomical Research in the Southern Hemisphere	Minister John Halligan, Minister of State for Training, Skills, Innovation, Research and Development.
S16 04/12/2018	Committee Stage consideration of the Personal Injuries Assessment Board (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill 2018	Ms Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation
S17 05/12/2018	2018 Supplementary Estimates for Public Services - Vote 32 (Business, Enterprise and Innovation)	Ms Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation
S18 11/12/2018	Committee Stage consideration of the European Investment Fund Agreement Bill 2018	Ms Heather Humphreys T.D., Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation

## APPENDIX 6: Proceedings of the Select Committee

### IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

#### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Céadaoin 21, Feabhra, 2018*

*Wednesday 21, February, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 2.50p.m.

1. The Committee met at 2.50p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT.

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Heather Mhic Unfraidh (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), na Teachtaí Niall Ó Coileáin, Séamus Laighléis, Tomás Ó Niaidh, agus Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy Heather Humphreys (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) Deputies Niall Collins, James Lawless, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

3. BILLE NA GCUIDEACHTAÍ (INIÚCHTAÍ REACHTÚLA) 2017

3. COMPANIES (STATUTORY AUDITS) BILL 2017

Chrom an Coiste ar an mBille a bhreithniú.

The Committee took the Bill into consideration.

(i) *Aontaíodh* ailt 1 go 13, go huile.

(i) Sections 1 to 13, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(ii) Alt 14.

(ii) Section 14.

Tairgeadh leasú 1 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú*.

Amendment 1 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(iii) *Aontaíodh* ailt 15 go 28, go huile. *agreed to*.

(iii) Sections 15 to 28, inclusive,

(iv) Alt 29.

Tairgeadh leasú 2 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

(v) Aontaíodh ailt 30 go 32, go huile, *agreed to*.

(vi) Alt 33.

Tairgeadh leasú 3 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 4 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 5 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 6 (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

(vii) Aontaíodh Alt 34.

(viii) Alt 35.

Tairgeadh leasú 7 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 8 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

(iv) Section 29.

Amendment 2 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(v) Sections 30 to 32, inclusive,

(vi) Section 33.

Amendment 3 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 4 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 5 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 6 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(vii) Section 34 *agreed to*.

(viii) Section 35.

Amendment 7 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 8 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Tairgeadh leasú 9 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 9 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Tairgeadh leasú 10 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 10 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Section, as amended, agreed to.

(ix) Aontaíodh Alt 36.

(ix) Section 36 agreed to.

(x) Alt 37.

(x) Section 37.

Tairgeadh leasú 11 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 11 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Tairgeadh leasú 12 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 12 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Tairgeadh leasú 13 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 13 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Tairgeadh leasú 14 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 14 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Section, as amended, agreed to.

(xi) Aontaíodh Alt 38.

(xi) Section 38 agreed to.

(xii) Alt 39.

(xii) Section 39.

Tairgeadh leasú 15 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Amendment 15 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Section, as amended, agreed to.

(xiii) *Aontaíodh ailt 40 go 44, go huile, agreed to.*

(xiv) Alt 45.

Tairgeadh leasú 16 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 17 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 18 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 19 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 20 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 21 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

*Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.*

(xv) *Aontaíodh ailt 46 go 50, go huile, to.*

(xvi) Alt 51.

Tairgeadh leasú 22 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 23 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 24 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh*

(xiii) Sections 40 to 44, inclusive,

(xiv) Section 45.

Amendment 16 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 17 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 18 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 19 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 20 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 21 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, agreed to.

(xv) Sections 46 to 50, inclusive, agreed

(xvi) Section 51.

Amendment 22 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 23 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 24 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and

*an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 25 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 26 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 27 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 28 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú.*

Tairgeadh leasú 29 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú.*

*Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.*

(xvii) *Alt nua.*

Tairgeadh leasú 30 (*An tAire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus aontaíodh *an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua.*

(xviii) *Aontaíodh Alt 52.*

(xix) *Aontaíodh ailt 53 go 74, go huile. agreed to.*

(xx) *Aontaíodh Sceidil 1 agus 2.*

(xxi) *Aontaíodh an Teideal.*

#### 4. CRÍOCHNÚ AN GHNÓ.

Chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an mBille ar a 3.30p.m.

#### 5. TEACHTAIREACHT CHUIG DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a

*agreed to.*

Amendment 25 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to.*

Amendment 26 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to.*

Amendment 27 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to.*

Amendment 28 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to.*

Amendment 29 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to.*

Section, as amended, *agreed to.*

(xvii) *New section*

Amendment 30 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to – new section inserted.*

(xviii) *Section 52 agreed to.*

(xix) *Sections 53 to 74, inclusive,*

(xx) *Schedules 1 and 2 agreed to.*

(xxi) *Title agreed to.*

#### 4. CONCLUSION OF BUSINESS.

The Committee concluded its consideration of the Bill at 3.30p.m.

#### 5. MESSAGE TO DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Message sent to the Dáil acquainting it that the Committee had completed its

bhreithniú ar an mBille agus go raibh leasuithe déanta aige air.

6. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 3.30p.m *sine die*.

consideration of the Bill and had made amendments thereto.

6. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 3.30p.m *sine die*.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D.



## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Máirt, 27 March, 2018*

*Tuesday, 27 March, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 5.05 p.m.

1. The Committee met at 5.05 p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT.

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

The following Members were present:

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Heather Mhic Unfraidh (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), An Teachta Pádraig Ó Briain (*Aire Stáit um Thrádáil, Fostaíocht, Gnó, Margadh Aonair Digiteach AE agus Cosaint Sonraí*) An Teachta Seán Ó hAileagáin (*Aire Stáit um Oiliúint, Scileanna, Nuálaíocht, Taighde agus Forbairt ag an Roinn Gnó, Fiontar agus Nuálaíochta*), na Teachtaí Niall Ó Coileáin, Stiofán Ó Donnghaile, Séamus Laighléis agus Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy Heather Humphreys (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) Deputy Pat Breen (*Minister of State for Trade, Employment, Business, EU Digital Single Market and Data Protection*) Deputy John Halligan (*Minister of State for Training, Skills, Innovation Research and Development at the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Niall Collins, Stephen Donnelly, James Lawless and Maurice Quinlivan.

3. BREITHNIÚ AR MHEASTACHÁIN I GCOMHAIR SEIRBHÍSÍ POIBLÍ.

3. CONSIDERATION OF ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2018 –

The Committee considered the following Estimate for Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2018 –

Vóta 32 (Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht) (Meastachán Athbhreithnithe).

Vote 32 (Business, Enterprise and Innovation) (Revised Estimate).

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán.

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán.

4. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 19.55 p.m. *sine die*.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Estimate.

4. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 19.55 p.m. *sine die*.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D.  
Chair

## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Céadaoin, 9 Bealtaine 2018*

*Wednesday, 9 May 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 16.45p.m.

1. The Committee met at 16.45p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR<sup>1</sup>.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT<sup>2</sup>.

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Pádraig Ó Briain (*Aire Stait ag an Roinn Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), na Teachtaí Liam Ó Céilleachair, Tómas Ó Niaidh, Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin agus Clár Ní Dhálaigh.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy Pat Breen (*Minister of State at the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Billy Kelleher, Tom Neville, Maurice Quinlivan and Clare Daly.

3. AN BILLE UM FHORBAIRT TIONSCAIL (LEASÚ) 2018

3. INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT (AMENDMENT) BILL 2018

(i) *Aontaíodh* ailt 1 go 3, go huile.

(i) Sections 1 to 3, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(ii) Alt 4.

(ii) Section 4.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt.*

Question put and *decided in the affirmative – section agreed to.*

(iii) Alt 5.

(iii) Section 5.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt.*

Question put and *decided in the affirmative – section agreed to.*

---

<sup>1</sup> Bhí an Teachta Clár Ní Dhálaigh i láthair [B.O. 95(3)].

<sup>1</sup> Deputy Clare Daly attended [S.O. 95(3)].

(iv) Alt 6.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt.*

(v) Alt 7.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt.*

(vi) Alt 8.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt.*

(vii) *Aontaíodh alt 9.*

(viii) *Aontaíodh an Teideal.*

4. TEACHTAIREACHT CHUIG DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an mBille agus nach raibh aon leasú déanta aige air.

5. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 5.15p.m. go dtí 4.45p.m. Dé Céadaoin 13 Meitheamh 2018.

(iv) Section 6.

Question put and *decided in the affirmative – section agreed to.*

(v) Section 7.

Question put and *decided in the affirmative – section agreed to.*

(vi) Section 8.

Question put and *decided in the affirmative – section agreed to.*

(vii) Section 9 *agreed to.*

(viii) Title *agreed to.*

4. MESSAGE TO DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Message sent to the Dáil acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Bill and had made no amendment thereto.

5. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 5.15p.m until 4.45p.m. on Wednesday 13 June, 2018.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D  
Chair

## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Céadaoin, 13 Meitheamh, 2018*

*Wednesday, 13 June, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 4.50p.m.

1. The Committee met at 4.50p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR

2. MEMBERS PRESENT

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Seán Ó hAileagáin (*Aire Stait ag an Roinn Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), na Teachtaí Tomás Ó Niaidh, Liam Ó Ceilleachair, Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin agus Séamus Laighléis.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy John Halligan (*Minister of State at the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Tom Neville, Billy Kelleher, Maurice Quinlivan and James Lawless.

3. AN BILLE UM CHÓIPCHEART AGUS FORÁLACHA EILE DE CHUID AN DLÍ MAOINE INTLEACTÚLA 2018.

3. COPYRIGHT AND OTHER INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW PROVISIONS BILL 2018

Chrom an Coiste ar an mBille a bhreithniú.

The Committee took the Bill into consideration.

(i) *Aontaíodh* ailt 1 go 26, go huile.

(i) Sections 1 to 26, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(ii) Alt 27.

(ii) Section 27.

Tairgeadh leasú 1 (*An Teachta Laighléis*) *tarraingíodh siar an leasú, faoi chead*.

Amendment 1 (*Deputy Lawless*) proposed and, by leave, *withdrawn*.

(iii) *Aontaíodh* ailt 28 go 39, go huile.

(iii) Sections 28 to 39, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(iv) Alt 40.

(iv) Section 40.

Tairgeadh leasú 2 (*Aire Stáit ag an Roinn Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú*.

Amendment 2 (*Minister of State at the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Tairgeadh leasú 3 (*Aire Stáit ag an Roinn*

Amendment 3 (*Minister of State at the*

*Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht) agus aontaíodh an leasú.*

*Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation) proposed and agreed to.*

*Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.*

*Section, as amended, agreed to.*

*(v) Aontaíodh ailt 41 go 105, go huile.*

*(v) Sections 41 to 105, inclusive, agreed to.*

*(vi) Aontaíodh Sceidil 1 go 4, go huile.*

*(vi) Schedules 1 to 4 inclusive, agreed to.*

*(vii) Aontaíodh an Teideal.*

*(vii) Title agreed to.*

#### 4. TEACHTAIREACHT CHUIG DÁIL ÉIREANN.

#### 4. MESSAGE TO DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an mBille agus go raibh leasuithe déanta aige air.

Message sent to the Dáil acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Bill and had made amendments thereto.

#### 5. ATHLÁ.

#### 5. ADJOURNMENT.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 17.15p.m go dtí 16.45p.m. Dé Céadaoin, 20 Meitheamh, 2018.

The Committee adjourned at 17.15p.m until 16.45p.m. on Wednesday, 20 June, 2018.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D.  
Chair

**IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE**  
**PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE**

---

*Dé Céadaoin, 20, Meitheamh, 2018*

*Wednesday, 20, June, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 16.45p.m.

1. The Committee met at 16.45p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT.

An Teachta Máire de Buítléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Seán Ó hAileagáin (*Aire Stait ag an Roinn Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), na Teachtaí Liam Ó Ceilleachair, Séamus Laighléis, Tómas Ó Niaidh agus Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy John Halligan (*Minister of State at the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Billy Kelleher, James Lawless, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

3. BREITHNIÚ AR THAIRISCINT.

3. CONSIDERATION OF MOTION.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an tairiscint seo a leanas arna tarchur ag Dáil Éireann an 14 Meitheamh, 2018.

The Committee considered the following motion referred by Dáil Éireann on 14 June, 2018.

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an tairiscint.

Consideration of the motion was concluded.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 agus Ordú an 14 Meitheamh, 2018 ón Dáil, á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an tairiscint.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 and the Order of the Dáil of 14 June, 2018, acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the motion.

4. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 17.15 p.m  
*sine die.*

4. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 17.15p.m  
*sine die.*



---

Mary Butler, T.D.  
Chair



## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Máirt, 4 Nollaig 2018*

*Tuesday, 4 December 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 6.50 p.m.

1. The Committee met at 6.50 p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR

2. MEMBERS PRESENT

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Heather Mhic Unfraídh (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*, na Teachtaí Lisa Nic Ambróis, Liam Ó Céilleachair, Séamus Laighléis, Tómas Ó Niaidh agus Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy Heather Humphreys (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Lisa Chambers, Billy Kelleher, James Lawless, Tom Neville and Maurice Quinlivan.

3. AN BILLE UM BORD MEASÚNAITHE DÍOBHÁLACHA PEARSANTA (LEASÚ) (UIMH. 2) 2018

3. PERSONAL INJURIES ASSESSMENT BOARD (AMENDMENT) (NO. 2) BILL 2018

Chrom an Coiste ar an mBille a bhreithniú.

The Committee took the Bill into consideration.

(i) *Aontaíodh* ailt 1 go 7, go huile.

(i) Sections 1 to 7, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(ii) Alt 8.

(ii) Section 8.

Tairgeadh leasú 1 (*An Teachta Ó Céilleachair*), agus *tarraingíodh siar an leasú*, faoi chead.

Amendment 1 (*Deputy Kelleher*), proposed and, by leave, *withdrawn*.

Tairgeadh leasú 2 (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus *aontaíodh an leasú*.

Amendment 2 (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) proposed and *agreed to*.

Cuireadh an Cheist agus *cinneadh gur freagra aontach a tugadh uirthi-aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh*.

Question on the section put and *decided in the affirmative – section, as amended, agreed to*.

(iii) *Aontaíodh* ailt 9 go 15, go huile.

(iii) Sections 9 to 15, inclusive, *agreed to*.

iv) *Aontaíodh* an Teideal.

4. TEACHTAIREACHT CHUIG DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála á chur in iúl di go raibh an Coiste tar éis a bhreithniú ar an mBille a chríochnú agus go raibh leasú déanta aige air

5. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 7.30p.m go dtí 2p.m. Dé Céadaoin 5 December 2018.

(iv) Title *agreed to*.

4. MESSAGE TO DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Message sent to the Dáil acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Bill and had made an amendment thereto.

5. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 7.30p.m until 2p.m. on Wednesday 5 December 2018.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D.  
Chair

**IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE**  
**PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE**

---

*Dé Céadaoin, 5 Nollag, 2018*

*Wednesday, 5 December, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste 2.05p.m.

1. The Committee met at 2.05p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR<sup>3</sup>.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT<sup>4</sup>.

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

The following Members were present:

An Teachta Máire de Buitléir, (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Heather Mhic Unfraidh (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*), na Teachtaí Cáit Uí Chonaill agus Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin.

Deputy Mary Butler (*in the Chair*), Deputy Heather Humphreys (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*), Deputies Kate O'Connell and Maurice Quinlivan.

3. BREITHNIÚ AR MHEASTACHÁIN FORLÍONTACH I GCOMHAIR SEIRBHÍSÍ POIBLÍ.

3. CONSIDERATION OF SUPPLEMENTARY ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán Forlíontach seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2018

The Committee considered the following Supplementary Estimate for Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2018

Vóta 32 (Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht) (Meastachán Forlíontach).

Vote 32 (Business, Enterprise and Innovation) (Supplementary Estimate).

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán Forlíontach)

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán Forlíontach.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Supplementary Estimate.

---

<sup>3</sup>

Deputy Kate O'Connell substituted for Deputy Tom Neville [S.O. 95(2)].

Ghlac an Teachta Cáit Uí Chonaill ionaid an Teachta Tomás Ó Niaidh faoi seach [B.O. 95(2)].

4. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 2.50p.m go dtí 4p.m, Tuesday 11 December, 2018.

4. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 2.50p.m until 4p.m. on Tuesday 11 December, 2018.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Mary Butler".

---

MARY BUTLER, T.D.  
Chair

## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE

---

*Dé Máirt, 11 Nollaig, 2018*

*Tuesday, 11 December, 2018*

---

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 4p.m.

1. The Committee met at 4p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT

An Teachta Tómas Ó Niaidh (*i gCeannas*), An Teachta Heather Mhic Unfraidh (*Aire um Ghnó, Fiontair agus Nuálaíocht*) agus an Teachta Muiris Ó Caoindealbháin.

Deputy Tom Neville (*in the Chair*), Deputy Heather Humphreys (*Minister for Business, Enterprise and Innovation*) and Deputy Maurice Quinlivan.

3. BILLE FÁ CHOMHAONTÚ UM AN GCISTE EORPACH INFHEISTÍOCHTA 2018. [SEANAD]

3. EUROPEAN INVESTMENT FUND AGREEMENT BILL 2018. [SEANAD]

Chrom an Coiste ar an mBille a bhreithniú.

The Committee took the Bill into consideration.

(i) *Aontaíodh* ailt 1 go 5, go huile.

(i) Sections 1 to 5, inclusive, *agreed to*.

(ii) *Aontaíodh* an Teideal.

(ii) Title *agreed to*.

4. TEACHTAIREACHT CHUIG DÁIL ÉIREANN.

4. MESSAGE TO DÁIL ÉIREANN.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an mBille agus nach raibh aon leasú déanta aige air.

Message sent to the Dáil acquainting it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Bill and had made no amendment thereto.

5. ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 4.05p.m *sine die*.

5. ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 4.05p.m *sine die*.



---

MARY BUTLER T.D.  
Chair