

**COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THURSDAY, 27 JUNE, 2019**

The Committee met in **Public Session** at 09.15 a.m. in Committee Room 3, LH 2000, a quorum being present.

The following members were present:-

**Deputies:** Sean Fleming; Bobby Aylward; Peter Burke; Shane Cassells; Catherine Connolly; David Cullinane; Alan Kelly; Marc MacSharry; Catherine Murphy; Jonathan O’Brien; and Kate O’Connell.

**Apologies** from Deputy Pat Deering.

Also present:

Mr. Seamus McCarthy – Comptroller and Auditor General

Ms. Ruth Foley – Deputy Director of Audit

**1. Minutes of the Meetings of:**

30 May 2019 and 13 June 2019

Agreed and agreed to publish.

20 June 2019

Not circulated.

**2. Matters Arising**

No matters arising.

<b>3. Correspondence received</b>		
<b>A - Briefing documents and opening statements</b>		<b>Decision</b>
32R002272-PAC	Ray Mitchell, Assistant National Director, Health Service Executive, dated 23/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002273-PAC	Derek Finnegan, Parliamentary Affairs, Department of Health, dated 21/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002275-PAC	Ray Mitchell, Assistant National Director, Health Service Executive, dated 25/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002276-PAC	Jim Breslin, Secretary General, Department of Health dated 26/06/2019	Note and Publish.
<b>B - Correspondence from Accounting Officers and/or Ministers and follow up to PAC meetings</b>		<b>Decision</b>
32R002161-PAC (Held Over)	Paul O’Toole, Chief Executive Officer, The Higher Education Authority, dated 10/05/2019	Previously Noted and Published. Hold Over.
32R002231-PAC	John McKeon, Secretary General, Department of Employment Affairs and Social Protection, dated 07/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002244-PAC	Crónan Goodman, Private Secretary to the Secretary General, Office of the Secretary General, Department of Justice and Equality, dated 11/06/2019	Note and Publish.

**COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THURSDAY, 27 JUNE, 2019**

<b>3. Correspondence received</b>		
32R002246-PAC	Crónan Goodman, Department of Justice, Office of the Secretary General, Department of Justice and Equality, dated 11/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002254-PAC	Peter Wood, Irish Prison Service, dated 17/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002262-PAC	Margaret Fitzgerald, Private Secretary to the Secretary General, Department of Finance, dated 20/06/2019	Noted. Await a full response from the Department.
32R002265-PAC	Mary Donohoe, Office of the Director General, EPA, dated 20/06/2019	Note and Publish. Ask for clarification in relation to bathing water and any relevant monitoring of this by the EPA.
32R002266-PAC	Dee Forbes, Director General, RTÉ, dated 20/06/2019	Note and Publish. Ask for update from RTÉ at the end of September
32R002267-PAC	Richard Lodge, Director, Pre-Hospital Emergency Care Council, dated 17/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002268-PAC	Mark Griffin, Secretary General, Department of Communications, Climate Action and Environment, dated 13/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002269-PAC	Gabriel Cooney, Chairperson, The Discovery Programme, dated 17/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002270-PAC	Aidan Farrell, CEO, State Examinations Commission, dated 18/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002271-PAC	JA Harris, Commissioner, An Garda Síochána, dated 17/06/2019	Note and Publish.
32R002274-PAC	Robert Watt, Secretary General, Department of Public Expenditure and Reform, dated 25/06/2019	Note and Publish. Request a copy of any communication with the Department of Health already released through Freedom of Information requests and a copy of any other items as they become available.
32R002278-PAC	Gerard Dollard, CEO, Irish Greyhound Board, dated 25/06/2019	Note and Publish. Add to Work Programme for after the recess.
<b>C - Correspondence from and related to private individuals and any other correspondence</b>		<b>Decision</b>
32R002243-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 09/06/2019	Noted. Inform correspondent the Committee agreed to await a Dáil debate on this matter.

**COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THURSDAY, 27 JUNE, 2019**

<b>3. Correspondence received</b>		
32R002245-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 11/06/2019	Noted.
32R002250-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 14/06/2019	Noted. Forward to relevant committee for any action they deem appropriate.
32R002251-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 14/06/2019	Noted.
32R002252-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 14/06/2019	Noted.
32R002260-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 18/06/2019	Noted.
32R002261-PAC	Correspondence received, dated 20/06/2019	Noted. Request an information note including information on the appeal of commercial rates appeals by business owners, the revaluation programme and an up to date note on the position of the Valuation Office and how it is progressing.

The Committee went into **private session** at 10.03 a.m. to discuss some further items of correspondence and other housekeeping matters.

The Committee agreed the timeline for approving and publishing its sixth Periodic Report.

The Committee agreed to hold an informal meeting to discuss matters relating to the IBRC resolution.

**4. Accounts and Statements received since the meeting of the 20 June 2019**

Ref	Body/main purpose	Accounting period/turnover	Date certified	Date received	Audit opinion/notes
4.1	<b>Marine Institute</b>	2017 €47 million	17 Dec 2018	14 May 2019	Clear audit opinion
4.2	<b>National University of Ireland, Maynooth</b>	30 Sep 2018 €164 million	15 Apr 2019	17 Jun 2019	Clear audit opinion Attention is drawn to <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the recognition of a deferred pension funding asset (standard for universities)</li> <li>• a provision of €750,000 in the University statement of comprehensive income and expenditure in relation to impairment of a loan to a loss making subsidiary company set up to commercialise intellectual property and to provide consultancy and training services.</li> </ul>

**COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THURSDAY, 27 JUNE, 2019**

Ref	Body/main purpose	Accounting period/turnover	Date certified	Date received	Audit opinion/notes
4.3	<b>Fishery Harbour Centres</b>	2017 €6.1 million	21 Dec 2018	19 Jun 2019	Clear audit opinion
4.4	<b>Credit Union Fund Account</b>	2018 €4.5 million	12 Jun 2019	21 Jun 2019	Clear audit opinion

Agreed.

It was agreed to write to NUI Maynooth to ask for full background in relation to the loan to a loss making company.

**5. Work Programme**

Work Programme agreed.

**6. Any other business**

The Committee suspended at 10.09 a.m. to allow witnesses to take their seats.

The Committee went into in **public session** at 10.17 a.m.

**7. Witnesses Examined**

**Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General**

- Mr. Seamus McCarthy, Comptroller and Auditor General
- Ms. Ruth Foley, Deputy Director of Audits

**Department of Public Expenditure & Reform**

- Ms. Maria Mulvihill, Principal Officer

**Department of Health**

- Mr. Jim Breslin, Secretary General
- Mr. Colm Desmond, Assistant Secretary, Finance & Evaluation

**Health Service Executive**

- Mr. Paul Reid, Director General
- M. Anne O'Connor, Deputy Director General, Operations
- Mr. Stephen Mulvaney, Chief Financial Officer
- Mr. Joe Ryan, National Director, National Services
- Ms. Mairead Dolan, Assistant Chief Financial Officer

**Matters for discussion**

- Appropriation Accounts 2017
  - Vote 38 – Department of Health

**COMMITTEE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS**  
**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THURSDAY, 27 JUNE, 2019**

- HSE Financial Statements 2018
- C&AG Report on the Accounts of the Public Services 2017
  - Chapter 16: Control of private patient activity in acute public hospitals

The Committee suspended at 13.07 p.m.

The Committee resumed at 15.14 p.m.

It was agreed to request the Clerk to seek any agreed follow-up information and carry out any agreed actions arising from the meeting.

**8. Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 17.17 p.m. until 4 July 2019.

---

Sean Fleming, T.D  
Chairman  
4 July 2019