

28th February 2019

Mr. Kieran Lenihan
Secretary of the Committee of Public Accounts
Committee of Public Accounts
Leinster House
Dublin 2.

Dear Mr. Lenihan,

I refer to the Department of the Taoiseach PAC appearance of 7th February last in relation to Vote 2 Appropriation Account 2017.

I am advised that at that meeting, within the context of questions raised in relation to payments made from the Department of the Taoiseach Vote 2017, officials from my Department were questioned by the Chairman in relation to costs of Public Inquiries.

I understand that my officials noted that Tribunals and Commissions of Investigation were established by the Oireachtas in the first instance and that the Oireachtas agreed their terms of reference.

I am advised that my officials duly informed the Chairman that while this Department is not directly responsible for any Public Inquiry, quarterly data is collected on an informal basis in relation to costs incurred. My officials offered to share this data with the Committee once verified by the responsible Departments. I understand that the Chairman indicated that this information would be very helpful for the Committee. In addition, the Chairman requested that 2019 budgetary allocations in relation to these Inquiries also be forwarded to the Committee.

Please see attached breakdown of information that I am now providing as follows:

- Cumulative costs of Public Inquiries as at end December 2018
- Cost of Public Inquiries for 2018
- Breakdown of 2018 costs by Admin Costs, Legal Costs and 3rd Party Costs
- Public Inquiry Budgetary allocations for 2019

I would re-iterate that payment of costs in relation to public inquiries is a matter for the relevant line Departments under which the public inquiry operates and where budgetary allocations are assigned for this purpose.

I hope that this information is helpful for the Committee.

Yours sincerely,



Robert Watt
Secretary General

Costs of Public Inquiries to end Dec 2018

€457,582,425

Tribunals of Inquiry

Name of Tribunal	Topic of Investigation	Status	Cumulative Costs ¹
Tribunal of Inquiry into certain payments to politicians and related matters. <i>Moriarty(1997)</i>	Inquiry into payment to politicians and related matters.	Concluded	€ 63,294,043 updated
Tribunal of Inquiry into suggestions that members of the Garda Síochána or other employees of the state colluded in the fatal shooting of RUC Chief Superintendent Harry Breen and Robert Buchanan on 20/02/1989. <i>Smithwick(2006)²</i>	To inquire into suggestions that members of the Garda Síochána or other employees of the State colluded in the fatal shootings of the RUC Chief Superintendent Harry Breen and RUC Superintendent Robert Buchanan in 1989.	Concluded	€ 19,886,714 updated
Tribunal of Inquiry into the infection with HIV and Hepatitis C of persons with Haemophilia and related matters. <i>Lindsay(1999)</i>	To inquire into the infection with HIV and Hepatitis C of people with Haemophilia and related matters	Concluded	€ 46,677,704
Tribunal of Inquiry into the Blood Transfusion Board. <i>Finlay(1997)</i>		Concluded	€ 4,380,601
Tribunal of Inquiry into certain planning matters and payments. <i>Mahon(1997)</i>	Established to inquire and report on various planning matters passed in the Dail and Seanad on 7/8 October 1997 and further extended to include dates up to Nov 2004	Ongoing	€ 135,539,993 updated
Tribunal of Inquiry into certain Gardaí in the Donegal Division.	Established to examine complaints relating to certain members of the Donegal Division of the Garda Síochána.	Concluded	€ 68,773,017 updated

¹ Expenditure as at end Dec 2018

² 3rd party costs remain to be paid Smithwick & Morris
Red bold indicates expenditure occurring

<i>Morris(2002)</i>			
Tribunal of Inquiry into Protected Disclosures Charleton(2017)	Established to Inquire into treatment of Individuals who provide a protected disclosure	Ongoing	€ 2,944,138 updated
TOTAL TRIBUNALS			€ 341,496,210

Red bold indicates expenditure occurring

Commissions of Investigation

Name of Commission	Topic of Investigation	Status	Cumulative Costs
Commission of Investigation into Irish Bank Resolution Corporation. <i>Cregan(2015)</i>	Established to investigate certain matters considered by the Government to be of significant public concern in respect of the Irish Bank Resolution Corporation (IBRC).	Ongoing	€ 5,065,824 updated
Commission of Investigation(Certain Matters relative to An Garda Siochana and other persons). <i>Fennelly(2014)</i>	Investigation into Garda Síochána phone recordings. Investigation in to the death of Sophie Toscan du Plantier. Investigation into the retirement of Martin Callinan.	Concluded	€ 3,528,658
Commission of Investigation (Certain Matters relative to the Cavan/Monaghan division of An Garda Síochana. <i>O'Higgins(2015)</i>	Garda Whistle-blower case.	Concluded*	€ 1,784,352 updated
Commission of Investigation(Ronan MacLochlainn) <i>Maclochlainn(2014)</i>	Investigation into the fatal shooting of Mr. Ronan MacLochlainn by members of the Garda Síochána in May 1998 in Ashford, Co Wicklow.	Ongoing	€ 1,170,871 updated
Commission of Investigation (<i>Leas Cross Nursing Home</i>)(2007)	Established to examine matters relating to the management, operation and supervision of Leas Cross Nursing Home	Concluded	€ 2,104,749
Commission of Investigation into Catholic Archdiocese of Dublin (including diocese of Cloyne)(2009)	Established to examine the handling of allegations of sexual abuse by members of the clergy.	Concluded	€ 8,788,639
Commission to Investigate into Dublin and Monaghan Bombings 1974 (2005)	After publication of Justice Henry Barron's report on the Dublin and Monaghan bombings, the Government established a follow-on Commission of Investigation: Dublin and Monaghan Bombings 1974 to inquire into certain aspects of the Gardaí investigation into the 1974 bombings on 13 May 2005 under Patrick MacEntee SC QC as sole member.	Concluded	€ 2,633,000

Commission to Investigate into Olympic ticketing in Rio <i>Moran (2016)</i>	Established to examine the Rio ticketing scandal – non-statutory private inquiry	Concluded	€ 312,765
Commission of Investigation to examine certain matters of public concern relating to the National Asset Management Agency (NAMA) (Project Eagle)	Examine matters of public concern relating to NAMA to include Project Eagle Memo 09/06/2017	Ongoing	€ 1,231,019 updated
Farrelly Commission of Investigation (Grace Case)	Establishment of a Commission of Investigation relating to the care of 'Grace' in a former foster home in the South East. Memo March 2017	Ongoing	€ 1,979,580 updated
Kenneally (Hickson) Commission of Investigation	Commission of Investigation Response to complaints or allegations of child sexual abuse made against Bill Kenneally and related matters Govt Decision July 2018	Ongoing	€ 14,079 updated
TOTAL COMMISSIONS			€ 28,613,536

**O'Higgins Commission was under judicial review on costings. No costs in 2017 or 2018.*

Red bold indicates expenditure occurring

Commissions to Inquire

Name of Commission	Topic of Investigation	Status	Cumulative Costs
Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (CICA) <i>Ryan/Laffoy(2000)</i>	The Commission was established on 23 May 2000, pursuant to the "Commission to inquire into Child Abuse Act 2000" and given three primary functions; in summary, to hear evidence, conduct an inquiry and prepare and publish reports	Concluded	€ 82,236,323 updated

Reports

Name of Report	Topic of Investigation	Status	Cumulative Costs
The Ferns Report <i>(2005)</i>	Inquiry into the handling of allegations of child sex abuse in the Diocese of Ferns	Concluded	€ 2,068,499
An Inquiry into peripartum hysterectomy at Our Lady of Lourdes Hospital, Drogheda. <i>Lourdes Inquiry(2004)</i>	Non statutory private inquiry into Peripartum Hysterectomy at Our Lady of Lourdes Hospital, Drogheda	Concluded	€ 2,955,403
Monageer Inquiry(2007)	Inquiry to examine the circumstances leading to and surrounding the deaths of the Dunne family in Monageer, Co Wexford	Concluded	€ 212,454
TOTAL REPORTS			€ 5,236,356

Red bold indicates expenditure occurring

Costs of Public Inquiries for 2018

€ 13,710,600

Tribunals of Inquiry

Department	Name of Tribunal	Status	2018 Costs
Department of The Taoiseach	Tribunal of Inquiry into certain payments to politicians and related matters. <i>Moriarty(1997)</i>	Concluded	€ 1,999,726
Department of Justice and Equality	Tribunal of Inquiry into suggestions that members of the Garda Síochána or other employees of the state colluded in the fatal shooting of RUC Chief Superintendent Harry Breen and Robert Buchanan on 20/02/1989. <i>Smithwick(2006)¹</i>	Concluded	€ 404,244
Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government	Tribunal of Inquiry into certain planning matters and payments. <i>Mahon(1997)</i>	Ongoing	€ 4,321,833
Department of Justice and Equality	Tribunal of Inquiry into certain Gardaí in the Donegal Division. <i>Morris(2002)</i>	Concluded	€ 0

3rd party costs remain to be paid Smithwick & Morris

Department of Justice and Equality	Tribunal of Inquiry into Protected Disclosures Charleton(2017)	Ongoing	€ 1,914,431
Total Tribunals			€ 8,640,234

Commissions of Investigation

Department	Name of Commission	Status	2018 Costs
Department of The Taoiseach	Commission of Investigation into Irish Bank Resolution Corporation. <i>Cregan(2015)</i>	Ongoing	€ 1,995,322
Department of Justice and Equality	Commission of Investigation (Certain Matters relative to the Cavan/Monaghan division of An Garda Siochana. <i>O'Higgins(2015)</i>	Concluded*	€ 0
Department of Justice and Equality	Commission of Investigation(Ronan MacLochlainn) <i>Maclochlainn(2014)</i>	Ongoing	€ 5,819
Department of The Taoiseach	Commission of Investigation to examine certain matters of public concern relating to the National Asset Management Agency (NAMA) (Project Eagle) <i>Cooke(2017)</i>	Ongoing	€ 881,270
Department of Health	Farrelly Commission of Investigation (Grace Case)	Ongoing	€ 1,484,983

Department of Justice and Equality	Kenneally Commission of Investigation <i>Hickson(2018)</i>	Ongoing	€ 14,079
Total Commissions			€ 4,381,473

**O'Higgins Commission was under judicial review on costings. No costs in 2017 or 2018.*

Commissions to Inquire

Department	Name of Commission	Status	2018 Costs
Department of Education and Skills	Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (CICA) <i>Ryan/Laffoy(2000)</i>	Concluded	€ 688,893
Total Commissions			€ 688,893

Estimated 2019 Allocations for relevant Inquiries

Department	Relevant Inquiry	2019 Allocation
Department of The Taoiseach	Cooke and Cregan Commission of Investigation	€ 4,515,000
Department of The Taoiseach	Moriarty Tribunal	€ 4,309,000
Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government	Mahon Tribunal	€ 5,582,000
Department of Education and Skills	Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse	€ 422,000
Department of Health	Farrelly Commission of Investigation	€ 1,500,000
Department of Justice and Equality	Morris Tribunal Smithwick Tribunal Charleton Tribunal O'Higgins Commission of Investigation MacLochlainn Commission of Investigation Kenneally (Hickson) Commission of Investigation	€ 4,900,000
Total		€ 21,228,000