

PAC32-R-1672(i) B Meeting 25/10/2018 An tOllamh Ciarán Ó hÓgartaigh BComm (Gaillimh), DipPrAcc (UCD),

PhD (Leeds), CA (Éire) Uachtarán

BComm (Galway), DipPrAcc (UCD), PhD (Leeds), CA (Ireland) President

16 October, 2018

Ms Margaret Falsey Committee of Public Accounts Secretariat Committee of Public Accounts Leinster House Dublin 2

Ref: PAC32-I-1096

Dear Ms Falsey,

I refer to your letter dated 10th instant under reference Ref: PAC32-I-1096 and request for notes on the following, which we are glad to provide:

1. Details of 'non-competitive' procurements €5.2m

We attach the requested list in Excel file format together with background explanation/details as furnished to C&AG - styled 'Appendix 111 - Finding 1', including actions to mitigate recurrence.

2. Severance Payment and out of office leave payroll cost €91k

It should be noted that the severance agreement is the subject of a confidentiality clause which you will appreciate the University is keen to honour.

The severance arrangement was discussed in advance with the Department of Education & Skills and approved by the Department in July, 2016. The University Secretary subsequently provided further clarification on the full context of the need for same to the C&AG.

As regards its accounting treatment, our divergence from the view held by the C&AG centres around the categorisation of ongoing payroll payments made to the former employee in the months prior to their departure.

The C&AG took the view that these regular payroll payments should be classified as an integral part of the redundancy agreement and should be reported as such. The University takes the view that the cost of these regular payroll payments should not be so classified. I understand the employee worked from their home in the period prior to their official cessation date and while so engaged, was also available for consultation and advice relating to their University role. Such advice was regularly sought by both our HR and Finance functions. They therefore continued to be an employee of the University. These costs were therefore part of normal payroll costs and so classified consistent with accounting norms.

It was and is our judgement therefore that the classification adopted in the financial statements for which we are responsible was consistent with accounting norms. We were also mindful of the agreement entered into by the University with the approval of the Department of Education and Skills, and its confidentiality clause.

We were also conscious that if the C&AG wished to disclose the item in his report, this obviated the need to amend the accounting treatment while being true to our view with regard to the correct treatment in the financial statements of NUI Galway for which we are responsible.

We hope this clarifies the matter. If you have any further questions in this regard, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Yours sincerely,

Professor Ciarán Ó hÓgartaigh

BComm (Galway), BipPrAcc (UCD), PhD (Leeds), FCA (Ireland)

Uachtarán, OÉ Gaillimh President, NUI Galway

Appendix III - Finding 1: Procurement - detailed narrative provided by NUIG

Background:-

In order to support the diverse range of activities across NUI Galway procurement has been devolved to operating units. The University has Policies and Procedures in place to drive compliance with Irish Government policy and EU Legislative Procurement Directives. Training is provided to all budget holders to communicate the policies and procedures and to support them to assure procurement compliance. The University adopts contracts and uses frameworks agreements put in place by the Office of Government Procurement (OGP) to support procurement compliance.

Management Comment in relation to 2016/17 Procurement Findings:-

In relation to the non-compliance total of €5,152,862 identified in the period under audit, the University has taken positive action and can report that :

- Action has been taken so that 39% of this total (€2,034,935) is now governed by a current
 procured compliant contract. Many of the actions to achieve this result had been initiated but
 not completed during the audit period (e.g. procurement of the Sports Centre Operator,
 procurement of security services and adoption of the HEAnet framework agreement for desktop
 software).
- 2. Action has been initiated to put contracts in place for a further 26% of this total (€1,353,916). Of the total of 22 procurement projects currently in process it is expected that 11 of these will be complete before the end of 017/18.
- 3. The University is currently reviewing the 35% of this total (€1,764,010) to develop a procurement plan. This figure represents over thirty separate suppliers where multiple transactions have taken place across multiple budget holders.

Additional Actions Initiated:-System Enhancements

- The University is planning enhancements to its Finance Management System (Agresso) due for completion in line with the 2018/19 audit period to support enhanced procurement compliance.
 These enhancements include:-
 - New workflows for requisitions greater than €25,000 (the tendering threshold)
 - o Additional pop-up screen to ensure purchaser is guided to comply with procurement policy.
 - o Facility to support mandatory uploading of quotations for requisitions greater than €5000.
- Audit Findings Track & Tracing Tool
 - Investment in a tool that will support the adoption and implementation of actions highlighted by audit reports.
- Suppliers are only setup on Agresso once a compliant procurement process has been undertaken.

Training

 The University has also doubled its investment in procurement training programmes and workshops to assist all budget holders attain and maintain compliance.

NUIG 2017 - Procurement

Winters Tim Kelly McNamara Cambridge Biosciences Q/S Quacquarelli Symonds Ltd. Mgt graphics G4S SECURE SOLUTIONS (IRELAND) LTD TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	127,98(8,8,44(96,91(92,36; 24,01; 20,25; 10,86; 460,83(373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155 80,337
McNamara Cambridge Biosciences Q/S Quacquarelli Symonds Ltd. Mgt graphics G4S SECURE SOLUTIONS (IRELAND) LTD TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	92,36: 24,01: 20,25: 10,86: 460,83(373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,331 135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
Cambridge Biosciences Q/S Quacquarelli Symonds Ltd. Mgt graphics G4S SECURE SOLUTIONS (IRELAND) LTD TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MYS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	24,01: 20,25: 10,86: 460,83(373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
Q/S Quacquarelli Symonds Ltd. Mgt graphics G4S SECURE SOLUTIONS (IRELAND) LTD TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	20,25: 10,86: 460,83i 373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
Mgt graphics G4S SECURE SOLUTIONS (IRELAND) LTD TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	10,86: 460,83(373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	373,302 241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
TOMKINS & CO MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	241,074 208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
MICROMAIL LIMITED CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	208,989 180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
CORE COMPUTER CONSULTANTS LTD CHARLES RIVER (UK) LTD PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	180,100 148,831 135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
PFH TECHNOLOGY GROUP PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	135,129 132,185 128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
PLAY THERAPY INTERNATIONAL LTD CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	132,185 128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
CROI WEST OF IRE CARDIOL FOUNDATION ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	128,375 124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
ABCAM LTD UNIT 4 BUSINESS SOFTWARE (IRELAND) LTD APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	124,370 113,500 110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
APCOA PARKING IRELAND TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	110,586 110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
TOP OIL GALWAY MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	110,314 97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
MVS CONSTRUCTION LTD S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	97,002 94,061 90,000 86,155
S GILL WINDOW MANUFACTURING LTD MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	94,061 90,000 86,155
MOLECULAR MEDICINE IRELAND (MMI) SHARP ALARMS LIMITED ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	90,000 86,155
ENTERPRISE IRELAND ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	
ENVIGO RMS (UK) LTD DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	80,337
DMT LIMITED T/A/ CODECDS	
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	77,059
FATEH EDUCATION	76,243 75,822
RENT AN IRISH COTTAGE MGMT LTD	73,668
BIO-TECHNE LTD (R & D SYSTEMS EUROPE LTD)	72,429
EMOS INFORMATION SYSTEMS LTD	62,160
	60,651
	54,428 52,210
	50,895
PARTRIDGE PEARTREE	50,209
I AND C DIGITAL	48,320
	48,305
	46,965 46,745
The state of the s	46,266
ENERGENAS LLC	43,318
CW DISTRIBUTORS LTD	43,309
MR PETER KENNEDY	42,139
	40,775 40,509
	38,033
O TUAIRISG ASSOCIATES LTD	36,553
TURNITIN UK LTD	35,050
	34,973
	34,322 34,254
BIOS IT	34,186
SWIMWORLD LTD T/A KINGFISHER	34,147
INTEGRATED DNA TECHNOLOGIES BVBA	33,991
	33,824
	32,505 32,206
	32,200
UPTODATE	31,781
LRC AS	31,455
ANNERTECH LTD	31,101
	31,064 30,600
	30,504
BECKER &HICKL GMBH	29,957
MODEPHARMA LIMITED	29,220
SITULA CONSULTING LIMITED	28,535
	28,368
	28,134 27,018
	27,000
SURVEY INSTRUMENT SERVICES LTD	26,980
JOHN O'DEA	26,780
IP PRAGMATICS LIMITED	26,671
	26,600
	26,495 26,198
ORACLE EMEA LTD	25,634
AKARI SOFTWARE LTD	25,448
HPRA HEALTH PRODUCT REGULATORY AUTHORITY	24,907
LEADERSHIP FOUNDATION FOR HIGHER EDUCATION	18,668
	4,692,032
	BIO-TECHNE LTD (R & D SYSTEMS EUROPE LTD) EMMOS INFORMATION SYSTEMS LTD CLF PLANTCLIMATICS GMBH NIALL O'LEARY WINTERS PROPERTY MANAGEMENT DAC HENDERSON FIRE & SAFETY LTD PARTRIDGE PEARTREE I AND C DIGITAL PC SPECIALIST LTD VECTOR WORKPLACE & FACILITY MGT LTD ADECCO IRELAND LIMITED, WESTERN HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE TRUST ENERGENAS LLC CW DISTRIBUTORS LTD MR PETER KENNEDY CLADA MEDICAL STAUNTON MEDIA A & L GOODBODY SOLICITORS O TUAIRISG ASSOCIATES LTD TURNITIN UK LTD MOTORPARK KELLY OFFICE SUPPLIES LTD NOONAN SERVICES GROUP BIOS IT SWIMWORLD LTD T/A KINGFISHER INTEGRATED DNA TECHNOLOGIES BVBA MACMILLAN PUBLISHERS LIMITED 01932810 PASSAX BUSINESS SYSTEMS & SUPPLIES LTD VCC SYSTEMS SRCL LIMITED UPTODATE LIRC AS ANNERTECH LTD PMI SOFTWARE LTD T/A PEMAC DIGI-AIRCIV ATHRU CONSULTANCY LTD BECKER &HICKL GMBH MODEPHARMA LIMITED SITULA CONSULTING LIMITED LEAP CLAT INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR TROPICAL AGRICULTURE GALWAY FILM CENTRE SURVEY INSTRUMENT SERVICES LTD JOHN O'DEA IP PRAGMATICS LIMITED JAMES MCCORMACK HEINZ WALZ GMBH INTERNATIONAL GRADUATE INSIGHT GROUP LTD ORACLE EMEA LTD AKARI SOFTWARE LTD HPRA HEALTH PRODUCT REGULATORY AUTHORITY