

**NATIONAL
PAEDIATRIC
HOSPITAL
DEVELOPMENT
BOARD**

27th November 2014

Ms. Margaret Falsey,
Committee Secretariat,
Committee of Public Accounts,
Leinster House,
Dublin 2.

Sir Patrick Dun's Hospital
Lower Grand Canal Street
Dublin 2

TEL **+353 (0) 1 642 4733**

www.newchildrenshospital.ie

Dear Ms. Falsey,

I refer to your correspondence of the 30th October concerning further information raised during the course of the Public Accounts Committee's examination of the **2012 financial statements of the National Paediatric Hospital Development Board**.

I enclose the following documentation in appendix 1 – 5 for the information of the Committee:

- Appendix 1: list of names and qualifications of those who were on the technical and financial evaluation boards and the process under which these personnel were selected
- Appendix 2: Breakdown of the various tender contracts awarded including successful candidates and the cost of each contract in respect of the St. James's site
- Appendix 3: A note of all contract payments made or agreed in respect of the development of the hospital at both the Mater site and St. James's
- Appendix 4: A note on the reasons why the impairment occurred including a note on the history of the project and a note on the application that was put forward to An Bord Pleanala for the Mater hospital site.
- Appendix 5: A note on the rent paid by the old Board for offices at No. 2-3 Parnell Street

I hope the enclosed information will be of assistance to the Committee.

Should you have any queries please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely,



John Pollock
Project Director
National Paediatric Hospital Development Board

Board Members:

- Mr. Tom Costello (Chair)
- Mr. Paul Quinn
- Mr. Brian Fitzgerald
- Ms. Anne Butler
- Mr. Karl Kent
- Mr. John Martin
- Mr. John Cole
- Ms. Marguerite Sayers
- Mr. Tim Boucher-Hayes
- Prof. Hilary Hoey
- Dr. Tony O'Connell

Appendix 1

Technical Evaluation Steering Committees

A list of the names and qualifications of those who were on the technical and financial evaluation boards and the process under which these personnel were selected

Name	Qualifications	Role
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]
[Faded Name]	[Faded Qualifications]	[Faded Role]

Introduction

At the outset of the procurement process for the design team for the new children’s hospital the National Paediatric Hospital Development Board (NPHDB) recognised the importance of selecting a high quality design team to deliver this project of national importance. In order to select the design team evaluation panels were assembled for each design discipline (lot). The NPHDB drew on their own board members and internal team together with appropriate well qualified personnel from the Health Service Executive (HSE), Children’s Hospital Group Board and other government departments to form the membership of each evaluation panel. The NPHDB with the HSE also contacted the Association of Consulting Engineers of Ireland (ACEI) to request evaluation panel members for Lot 3: Mechanical and Electrical Engineering Services and also Lot 4: Civil and Structural Engineering Services. The evaluation panels for each Lot are detailed below together with the qualifications of the members. It is evident that the members of each panel are highly qualified and appropriate for the evaluations of the various Lots.

Lot 1 – Architectural Services

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
John Cole	B.Sc (Arch), D.A.A.S., M.Sc (Project Management), F.I.H.E.E.M., RIBA, PPRSUA	NPHDB Board Member
Dr Emma Curtis	Consultant Paediatrician, MB, BCh, BAO, MRCPI, CDH	Medical Director to NPHDB
Karl Kent	B.Arch, MUBC, Dip. TP, DIP EIA(mgmt.), FRIAI, MIPI	NPHDB Board Member
Paul de Freine	B.Arch, MRIAI	HSE Estates, Chief Architectural Advisor
Eilish Hardiman	MBA, BSc, RGN,	CEO Children’s Hospital Group Board
Charlie Dolan	B.Arch, MRIAI	HSE Estates Architectural Adviser
Tom Costello	BE, MIEI, CEng	NPHDB Chairman
Phelim Devine	BSc(Eng), MIEI, CEng, HDip P.M, HDip Con. Law	NPHDB Design Director/Deputy Project Director

Lot 2 – Quantity Surveying Services

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Tom Costello	BE, MIEI, CEng	NPHDB Chairman
John Pollock	BE, MS, MIEI	NPHDB Project Director
Norman Craig	Fellow Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors	NPHDB Acting Commercial Director
Peter Finnegan	B.Sc. MRICS, MSCSI Chartered Quantity Surveyor	HSE Principal Quantity Surveying Advisor
	B.Sc. Dublin University MRICS;	
	Member of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors	
	MSCSI; Member of the Society of Chartered Surveyors Ireland	

Lot 3 – Mechanical and Electrical Engineering Services

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Joe Ennis	Chartered Engineer, DIP.ENV.ENG. CEng FIEI, FCIBSE, FConsEI, MASHRAE, ACEI Representative	Principal Engineer, JAE Engineering Ltd
Oliver Lynch	BEng Nat Dip CEng MIEI MCI Arb	BE &. Senior Engineer HSE
John Purcell	Chartered Engineer Fellow of the Institution of Engineers of Ireland Past President of the Association of Consulting Engineers of Ireland Chartered Member of the Chartered Institution of Building Services Engineers	Chairman Varming Consulting Engineers
	Bachelor of Engineering University College Dublin 1970 Master of Industrial Engineering University College Dublin 1974	
Frank Reilly	Technician Diploma in Building Services Engineering, Degree in Building Services Engineering Attained Chartership from Institution of Engineers of Ireland	Chartered Engineer, OPW
Jim Farragher	Fellow Institute of Chartered Accountants England & Wales Business Graduate UCD MBA UCG	NPDHB Finance Officer

Lot 4 – Civil and Structural Engineering Services

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Jim Curran	Chartered Status with Engineers Ireland Masters in Industrial Engineering UCD	Head of HSE Estates
John Fitzsimons	Bachelor of Engineering (Civil) Chartered Engineer, Engineers Ireland Master of Business Administration	NPHDB Capital Project Manager
Brendan McGrath	CEng, BE, MEngSc, MIEI, MIStructE Chartered Engineer, Member of Engineers Ireland Member of the Institution of Structural Engineers Bachelor of Engineering, UCD, Master of Engineering Science, UCD Diploma in Environmental Engineering, TCD	40 years post qualification experience in both the private and public sector
	Chartered Structural Engineer	

Ciaran MacIntyre	Chartered Member of the Institution of Structural Engineers,	Principal Carraig Consultants
	Member of Engineers Ireland, Member of the Chartered Institute of Arbitrators,	
	Fellow of the Institute of Healthcare Engineering & Estate Management	
	ACEI Registered Consulting Chartered Engineer	
	ACEI Representative	

Lot 5 – Project Supervisor Design Process

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Helen Maher	Environmental Science BSc,	HSE Estates Manager Env Svc.
	Post Grad Diploma – Environmental Engineering	
	Post Grad Diploma – Environmental Impact Assessment	
	Certified Energy Manager	
	Public Relations Cert	
Gareth Davies	C.M.I.O.S.H Chartered Member Institute Occupational Safety & Health	Estate Manager, Health, Safety & Infrastructural Risk, H.S.E.
	M.I.F.E Member of Institute of Fire Engineers	
	Member of the Construction Safety Partnership	
Jim Horgan	M.Sc. (Safety, Health & Environmental Management) University of Glamorgan 1996	Company Managing Director, Advanced Safety Management Ltd
	B.Sc. (Urban Estate Management) University of Glamorgan 1995	
	Chartered Member of Institute of Occupational Safety & Health CMIOSH 2006	
	Occupational Safety and Health Consultant Register OSHCR 2011	

Lot 6 – Fire Safety Consultant Services

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Aidan O'Connor	Chartered Member IOSH	HSE Estate Manager Fire Safety
	Member of the Institute of Fire Engineer	
	Post Graduate Diploma Fire Safety Practice	
	BSc.(Hons) in Occupational Safety and Health	
	Diploma in Occupational Safety and Health	
	Craft Based Technician Certificate	
Nicola McKenna	MSc. Fire Safety Engineering, University of Ulster	Fire Prevention and Safety Officer, HSE North East
	BSc. in Fire Technology	
	National Diploma in Construction Studies in Fire Technology	
	National Certificate in Construction Studies	
Martin Hernon	BSc (Hons) Architectural Technology	Fire Prevention & Safety Officer HSE DML, Housing Inspector Dep. Of Environment.
	Post Graduate Diploma Fire Safety Practice	
Mark McGoldrick	Chartered Engineer with Engineers Ireland (MIEI).	Fire Safety Manager, Irish Prison Service, Department of Justice
	Member of the Institute of Fire Engineer (MIFE).	
	MSc. Fire Safety Engineering, BSc. in Fire Technology	

	National Diploma in Construction Studies in Fire Technology	
--	---	--

Lot 7 –Planning Consultancy

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
John Martin	BA in History & Geography,	Planner in the public service from 1975 until retirement in 2011 as Principal Planning Adviser in the Dept. of the Environment, Community and Local Government
	MA in Geography	
	Diploma in Town Planning	
	Member Irish Planning Institute	
Charlie Dolan	B.Arch, MRIAI	HSE Estates Architectural Adviser

Lot 8 – Traffic Consultancy

Name	Qualification / Work Experience	
Helen Hughes	B.E. (Civil) UCD Diploma in Project Management UL Professional Memberships	NRA Senior Project Manager (Strategic Planning)
	Chartered Member of Engineers Ireland (1994)	
	Council Member of Engineers Ireland (2001-2004)	
	Member of Membership & Qualifications Board, Engineers Ireland (2009 -2010)	
John Martin	BA in History & Geography,	Planner in the public service from 1975 until retirement in 2011 as Principal Planning Adviser in the Dept. of the Environment, Community and Local Government
	MA in Geography	
	Diploma in Town Planning	
	Member Irish Planning Institute	

Niall McElwee	MSc Planning & Development, Dip Const Tech	Director of Capital Projects, St James Hospital
John Fitzsimons	Bachelor of Engineering (Civil) Chartered Engineer, Engineers Ireland	NPHDB Capital Project Manager
	Master of Business Administration	

Appendix 2

Breakdown of the various tender contracts awarded including successful candidates and the cost of each contract in respect of the St. James's site

Director of Capital Projects, 2019/20	Area Planning & Development, 2019/20	Lot 1
MWHQ Capital Works, 2019/20	Director of Engineering (Civil)	Lot 2
	Director of Planning (Civil)	
	Director of Planning (Structural)	

Lot	Description	Successful Tender	Value € (Ex VAT)
1	Architect	BDP	13,921,616
2	Quantity Surveyor	Bruce Shaw	3,537,048
3	Mechanical & Electrical	Arup	9,432,586
4	Civil & Structural	O'Connor Sutton Cronin	4,798,615
5	PSDP	Healy Kelly Turner Townsend	289,725
6	Fire Consultant	To Be Announced	
7	Planning	GVA	236,840
8	Traffic	Arup	497,104
			<hr/>
			<u>32,713,534</u>

Appendix 3

A note on all contract payments made or agreed in respect of the development of the hospital at both the Mater site and St. James's site

2008-
Mar.2014

Business Service Team

PM Group	24,289,760	
BDO	123,000	
Beauchamp's Solicitors	65,666	
	<u>24,478,426</u>	<u>24,478,426</u>

Project Management Team

PM - PMST	3,125,083	
Willis Risk Management	49,672	
Arc Architectural Consultants Ltd	5,445	
	<u>3,180,200</u>	<u>3,180,200</u>

Integrated Services Design Team

O'Connell Mahon - IDT Team	6,100,186	
RPS	80,262	
Byrne Looby Partners Ltd	58,062	
RWDI Anemos Limited	57,490	
Kaizen	32,621	
Maurice Johnson	19,965	
OHSS	14,747	

Rupert Taylor	8,470	
Elenfield Contractors Ltd	6,014	
Peter Rover	4,733	
Gamma Ltd	4,175	
Nationwide Data Collection	4,175	
	<u>6,390,899</u>	<u>6,390,899</u>

Appendix 4

A comprehensive note on the reasons why the impairment occurred including:

- 1) A note on the history of the project**
- 2) A note on the application that was put forward to An Bord Pleanála for the Mater hospital site.**

INTRODUCTION

The design for the project at the Mater site was commenced at the end of 2009 and was based on the site and the brief for the project approved by the HSE and the Minister. The total site area available on the Mater campus was 2.1 hectares and this was to include the site for the future Maternity hospital (although the Maternity hospital did not form part of the application). The brief for the project comprised a total floor area of approx. 108,000m² (excluding car park) and the NPHDB and the design team was charged with delivering this brief on the prescribed site at the Mater.

The design for the project was progressed from concept through to design stage through 2010 and early 2011 following the design team's appointment and was lodged for planning permission with An Bord Pleanála in July 2011.

PLANNING PROCESS

The NPHDB proceeded through 2009 and 2010 on the basis that an application for planning permission would be lodged in the normal manner with Dublin City Council, in accordance with the provisions of the Planning and Development Acts at the time.

However in 2010, the planning acts were amended by Section 78 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2010 to include for strategic healthcare developments to be considered Strategic Infrastructure Development (SID). The Act came into effect on 05th October 2010, just at the time that the planning application was ready to be lodged with Dublin City Council. The NPHDB was not consulted or advised of the proposed amendment prior to enactment.

Under the provisions of the Act a prospective applicant was obliged to enter into a pre-application consultation process with An Bord Pleanála, in order for the Board to establish whether the proposed development was deemed to be SID. Such projects would be obliged to apply for permission or approval directly to An Bord Pleanála and not to the Local Authority.

In this regard, pre-application consultations were then held with An Bord Pleanála on the 5th November 2010, the 2nd December 2010, and the 1st March 2011 as was required by Section 37B of the Act.

The NPHDB was formally advised by An Bord Pleanala on 26th April 2011 that it was of the opinion that the proposed development constituted a Strategic Infrastructure Development (SID) under the Act and therefore an application for planning permission would be required to be submitted to An Bord Pleanala and not to Dublin City Council.

The application documentation was then finalised and was lodged with An Bord Pleanala (ABP) in July 2011. An Oral Hearing for three weeks was held by ABP in October / November 2011 and a decision to refuse permission was issued by ABP in February 2012.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (EIS)

A full EIS was prepared in accordance with Schedule 6 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 and conformed to the relevant requirements as specified therein. The EIS was undertaken having regard to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) *Guidelines on information to be contained in Environmental Impact Statements (EPA 2002)* and *Advice Notes on Current Practice in preparation of Environmental Impact Statements (EPA 2003)* and the European Commission document "*Guidance on EIA, EIS Review*" (2001). The EIS was submitted to ABP with the Planning Application.

PRE-APPLICATION PUBLIC CONSULTATIONS

Prior to the lodgement of the planning application the NPHDB engaged with various stakeholders, such as user groups of the new hospital, especially children, families and healthcare personnel; representatives of the adjoining hospitals (MCHD Ltd. on behalf of the Mater Misericordiae University Hospital, and the Mater Private Hospital); the Railway Procurement Agency; and the planning authority, Dublin City Council.

The NPHDB also consulted with local residents groups, such as the 'BLEND' Residents' Association, The Berkeley Environmental Awareness Group, as well as individual residents of Leo Street and Nelson Street. The NPHDB retained a Community Advocate to canvas the local residents on main issues of concern for them. The Community Advocate Report documented residents' concerns relating to traffic impact (during construction), noise pollution, landscaping, and working hours, building height, overlooking, overshadowing and impacts on protected structures. The Project's Integrated Design Team had regard to these concerns in the hospital design and EIA process.

PRE-APPLICATION CONSULTATIONS WITH DUBLIN CITY COUNCIL

Prior to the 2010 change in Planning Legislation, the NPHDB attended a number of pre-planning meetings with planners from Dublin City Council (DCC), including Mr. Dick Gleeson, Dublin City Planning Officer, Mr. Paul Kearns, Senior Planning Officer, Ms. Margaret Coyle, Senior Executive Planner, as well as Ms. Ali Grehan, City Architect, Ms. Nicky Matthews, City Conservation Officer, Mr. Eoghan Madden, Senior Engineer of the Roads and Traffic Department and Mr. Vincent O'Sullivan, Senior Executive Engineer of the Water Services Division. The overall hospital project was discussed in these meetings with DCC at various dates, including the 15th December 2009, the 29th January 2010, the 25th February 2010, and the 19th of April 2010. A further, post-SID legislation change update meeting with DCC took place on the 12th January 2011.

The Board also consulted with the elected Local Area Councillors and made a detailed presentation of the proposals to the City Councillors at a meeting in City Hall in May 2011 prior to the making of the application to the Board.

PRE-APPLICATION CONSULTATIONS WITH AN BORD PLEANALA

As noted above, pre-application consultations were held with An Bord Pleanála on the 5th November 2010, the 2nd December 2010 and the 1st March 2011, however the Board's consultation was for the purpose of establishing that the project was a Strategic Infrastructure Development under the Planning Act. It also advised NPHDB on procedural matters in connection with the application and the documentation it required to be completed with the application.

The NPHDB planning and design team gave detailed presentations of the proposed design to ABP at the pre-application consultations; however, having regard to the Board's position under the Planning Acts, the Board was of the view that it could not offer any material advice to NPHDB on the proposed application prior to the submission of the application.

ADDITIONAL NON-MANDATORY CONSULTATIONS WITH PRESCRIBED BODIES

The project design team consulted with Department of Environment, Heritage and Local Government, the Heritage Council, An Taisce, the Railway Procurement Agency, the National Transport Authority, the National Roads Authority, the Irish Aviation Authority, the Dublin Airport Authority and the Health Service Executive and gave detailed presentations of the proposals to each group prior to the making of the application to the Board.

COMPLIANCE WITH THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT REGULATIONS 2001 (AS AMENDED) INCLUDING REQUIREMENTS REGARDING PLANNING APPLICATION DRAWINGS

Prior to making the planning application, the plans and particulars were screened with reference to the Planning & Development Regulations, 2001 to 2010 (the Regulations) in accordance with a request for same by An Bord Pleanála, as set out in advices given during the pre-application consultation process for this project.

STATUTORY PLANNING CONTEXT - DUBLIN CITY DEVELOPMENT PLAN 2011 TO 2017

The development site was located within the administrative area of Dublin City Council. The relevant Development Plan for the area was the Dublin City Development Plan 2011-2017, which came into effect on 22nd December 2010.

The site was zoned Z15 in the City Development Plan. The objective attached to this land use zone was: -

"To provide for institutional, educational, recreational, community, green infrastructure, and health uses"

The planning proposal was therefore in accordance with the Development Plan zoning recommendations.

SPECIFIC LOCAL AREA PLAN (LAP) POLICIES FOR THE MATER SITE IN THE CITY DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The Development Plan incorporated specific planning policies for the Mater site through the 2008 Phibsborough / Mountjoy Local Area Plan (LAP), which was incorporated in its entirety into the 2010 City Development Plan. The LAP provided planning policy support for the development of the Children's Hospital at the Mater Site through the following specific provisions in the Plan:

- The LAP supported major redevelopment and consolidation of the site as a medical facility of national and international significance following the Government decision to locate the new National Paediatric Hospital at the Mater Hospital
- The LAP noted that while the quantum of floorspace proposed had not been finalised at that time the hospital would require the development potential of the site to be maximised in order to deliver a world class medical facility, serviced by an underground metro station.
- The LAP specifically noted that because of the significant quantum of floorspace required it would be flexible with regard to the urban form and density of development including building height.
- It recognised that the requirement to deliver a world class medical facility on the site will result in a significant intensification of use and density, with considerable height increases.
- The LAP set aside the standard maximum plot ratio or quantum of development on the Mater site, and noted that these would be compatible with the overall height objectives of this LAP. It did, however note the optimum form of the development will take due regard to the established historic character of the adjoining buildings and the plan together with the effect of development proposals on the local microclimate, views and the skyline of the city. This was addressed in detail in the application submitted.
- The LAP directed that every effort must be made to ensure that increases in height will not have any negative overshadowing effects on adjoining properties or impact negatively on the settings of the protected structures both on the site and its periphery. This was also addressed in detail in the application submitted.

The Development Plan's LAP document indicated that the development site could contain buildings of 6 to 12 storeys and 12+ storeys.

In discussions with Dublin City Council, the authors of the LAP, it was agreed at a very early stage that 12+ storeys could allow up to sixteen storeys of development and the hospital design was developed on this basis through to the application for permission.

It was also agreed with Dublin City Council that while the LAP allowed a building of up to 12 storeys to be developed along Eccles street frontage that the NPHDB proposal for a lower building on the street, stepping back to 16 storeys behind was a preferable approach having regard to the historic character of the adjoining buildings on Eccles street, and this approach was also incorporated into the design for the hospital.

The LAP further sought to facilitate and support the optimum development of the Children's Hospital on the Mater site in accordance with the series of 15 no. objectives set out in the LAP.

These objectives, covered a wide range of issues such as providing a Masterplan for the site; promoting a design-led approach; contributing to streetscape and public realm improvements and

preserving of the amenity of adjoining residences, business, and conservation buildings. Each of the 15 no. objectives were each addressed in detail by NPHDB in the application documentation submitted to ABP.

DUBLIN CITY COUNCIL

As noted above NPHDB consulted with Dublin City Council (DCC) throughout the planning process in relation to the design of the proposed hospital and DCC supported the proposal both at consultation stage and through the Oral Hearing stage, by way of a formal submission to ABP.

DECISION BY ABP

The decision of ABP by a majority decision of 3 to 1, to refuse permission, was grounded in the fact that while the Board recognised the quality of the design it was of the view that the proposal represented overdevelopment of the site and consequently the impact on the area and city was too high. In summary the Board was of the view that the site was too small for the Children's hospital and the subsequent Maternity Hospital.

Appendix 5

**A note on the rent paid by the old Board for offices at No. 2-3
Parnell Street**

Year	Month	Rate	Amount
1891	Jan	£10	£10
1891	Feb	£10	£10
1891	Mar	£10	£10
1891	Apr	£10	£10
1891	May	£10	£10
1891	Jun	£10	£10
1891	Jul	£10	£10
1891	Aug	£10	£10
1891	Sep	£10	£10
1891	Oct	£10	£10
1891	Nov	£10	£10
1891	Dec	£10	£10
Total			£120

