

Karen  
Carton/Staff/Oireachtas  
26/09/2014 16:32

To pac@oireachtas.ie,  
cc  
bcc

Subject Fw: letter sent today to John Treacy of Irish Sports Council  
re Defective Recognition of Horse Sport Ireland

From: "Tom Reed" <tom@irish-warmblood.com>  
To: <ted.mcenery@oireachtas.ie>  
Cc: <admin@irish-warmblood.com>  
Date: 19/09/2014 15:12  
Subject: letter sent today to John Treacy of Irish Sports Council re Defective Recognition of Horse Sport Ireland

---

Dear Mr. McEnery,

I would be grateful if you submitted the email below, and the attached documents and jpg files, to the Chairman of the PAC for consideration by the Committee. The email below is the Warmblood Studbook of Ireland's (WSI) reply to Mr. John Treacy's letter to WSI, in which he responds to the document DEFECTIVE RECOGNITION AND FUNDING OF HSI BY THE IRISH SPORTS COUNCIL, sent to you on 30 June 2014.

Thank you very much.

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Thomas Reed  
Breeding Director  
Warmblood Studbook of Ireland

=====

Dear Mr. Treacy,

Thank you for your letter dated 17 July 2014, which replied to the Warmblood Studbook of Ireland's (WSI) document "Defective Recognition and Funding of HSI by the Irish Sports Council" and my email of 30 June 2014. Unfortunately your letter fails to address satisfactorily the substantive points made in the document and my email.

Your statement, "In line with the report's recommendations, on 1 January 2008 HSI became the umbrella body for equestrian sport in Ireland...", points to the crux of the problem. HSI was incorporated as a private company limited by guarantee as an UMBRELLA BODY. It has since morphed itself into a unique creature: a self-described national governing body (NGB) that does not govern, although it falsely presents itself to the public and its funders as having governing authority over equestrian sport. (As you may know, at times HSI also has presented itself as a public body and former Sport Minister Leo Varadkar wrote a letter to former HSI Chairman Joe Walsh chastising the company for these misrepresentations.)

Please provide the details of the verification process the ISC engaged in to assess whether HSI is the one national governing body for equestrian sport in Ireland, and the documentary evidence that resulted from the verification process. Please do not cite recognition by other bodies as justifying the ISC's recognition: the FEI's recognition of HSI appears to be defective, and is now under investigation by the FEI, and the Olympic Council of Ireland refuses

to provide WSI with any information about its recognition of HSI despite a half-dozen requests, which certainly does not inspire confidence in their decision or their decision process.

Has HSI supplied the ISC with an HSI rule book governing the sports of showjumping, eventing, dressage, and endurance, which would constitute proof that HSI exercises governance over these sports?

Has HSI supplied the ISC with signed agreements between HSI and Showjumping Ireland, Eventing Ireland, Dressage Ireland, and the Irish Long Distance Riding Association that passed governance of these sports from these NGBs to HSI?

Has HSI supplied the ISC with memoranda and articles of association from HSI, Showjumping Ireland, Eventing Ireland, Dressage Ireland, and the Irish Long Distance Riding Association that show that HSI exercises indirect governance over these equestrian sports through its direct governance and control of these NGBs?

For an organization to be national governing body it must GOVERN. WSI contends that HSI does not govern the equestrian disciplines of showjumping, eventing, dressage, and endurance (and a number of other equestrian disciplines) and therefore it fails to fulfil the fundamental criterion for ISC recognition. If the ISC contests this claim by WSI we insist that you provide evidence, above and beyond assurances made by HSI to the ISC, the FEI, and the Olympic Council of Ireland, that HSI has actual control or effective control over at least these four equestrian disciplines.

In your letter you made the statement "Contrary to the assertion made by you on 30 June 2014, the Showjumping Association of Ireland, Dressage Ireland and Eventing Ireland are not the national governing bodies for these Olympic equestrian disciplines." In fact HSI itself recognizes the sporting bodies you name as the NGBs for their respective sports. Attached to this email please find a number of digital images that supports WSI's conclusion that HSI is an umbrella body that serves as the FEI's national federation, not the national governing body for all equestrian sport in Ireland. You will see that even on HSI's homepage its management team acknowledges that Showjumping Ireland, Eventing Ireland, Dressage Ireland, and the Irish Long Distance Riding Association administer (a synonym for the word "govern") their respective sports.

A review of the rule books for Showjumping Ireland, Eventing Ireland, and Dressage Ireland will provide ample evidence that these independent national governing bodies, and not HSI, govern equestrian sport in Ireland.  
<http://www.sji.ie/Portals/0/2013%20Rule%20Book%20New%20Combined.pdf>  
[http://www.dressageireland.ie/downloads/Dressage\\_Ireland\\_\\_Rule\\_Book\\_2014.pdf](http://www.dressageireland.ie/downloads/Dressage_Ireland__Rule_Book_2014.pdf)  
<http://www.eventingireland.com/Portals/0/EasyDNNNewsDocuments/329/FINAL%20RULES%2021may14.pdf>

Moving on to the issue of the ISC's funding of HSI, you assert that the "ISC did not violate its founding state by recognizing and funding HSI..Furthermore, the ISC is permitted to establish different criteria in relation to different classes of recipients."

I agree that the ISC has the authority under law to establish various classes of recipients and to create different criteria for recognition and funding of the organizations in these classes. Please address the following questions:

1. What "class" does HSI belong to with respect to its



recognition and  
funding?

2. What are the features that characterize this "class"?
3. When was this "class" created?
4. Who approved the creation of this "class"?
5. What criteria must be met for an organization to be assigned to this "class"?
6. When were these criteria approved?
7. Who approved these criteria?
8. What other organizations have been included in this "class"?
9. Why were this class and the criteria for inclusion not disclosed to WSI when we requested information about the ISC's recognition and funding of HSI?
10. Why was it in the public interest to establish this class when in doing so the ISC violated the intent of the Oireachtas that public funds be invested only in well-established and well-managed sporting bodies whose primary and core function is the governance, management, and promotion of sport?

It appears that the ISC violated the legislative intent of the Oireachtas and the Irish Sports Council Act, 1999 by approving recognition and funding of HSI despite it not meeting a range of fundamental criteria designed to ensure that public funds are invested wisely. And seven years after recognition and funding it appears that HSI continues to fail to meet a number of fundamental criteria that the Oireachtas and the Act certainly intended.

I await your substantive replies to the issues raised in this email.

Yours sincerely,

Dr. Thomas Reed

[attachment "Dressage Ireland FB page.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "Eventing Ireland FB page.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "HSI - Dressage Ireland.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "HSI - Eventing Ireland.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "HSI - ILDRA.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "HSI - Para-Equestrian.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "HSI - Showjumping Ireland.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "ILDRA FB page.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "ISC letter p 1.JPG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "ISC letter p 2.JPG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "ISC letter p 3.JPG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas] [attachment "Showjumping Ireland FB page.PNG" deleted by Karen Carton/Staff/Oireachtas]